

The Corporation of the City of Kawartha Lakes
Committee of the Whole Report

Report Number ED2019-017

Date: September 10, 2019
Time: 1:00 p.m.
Place: Council Chambers

Ward Community Identifier: 5

Title: Proposed Designation of 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road

Description: Proposed Designation of 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road, Lindsay under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

Author and Title: Emily Turner, Economic Development Officer – Heritage Planning, on behalf of the Municipal Heritage Committee

Recommendation(s):

That Report ED2019-017, **Proposed Designation of 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road**, be received;

That the Committee of the Whole endorse the Municipal Heritage Committee’s recommendation to designate the 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road in Lindsay under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as being of cultural heritage value and interest;

That staff be authorized to proceed with the process to designate the subject property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, including preparation and circulation of a Notice of Intention to Designate, and preparation of a designating by-law; and

That this recommendation be brought forward to Council for consideration at the next Regular Council Meeting.

Department Head: _____

Financial/Legal/HR/Other: _____

Chief Administrative Officer: _____

Background:

At the meeting of August 1, 2019, the Municipal Heritage Committee adopted the following resolution:

Moved by J. Garbutt, Seconded by M. Sloboda

That the Municipal Heritage Committee requests staff prepares a report to Council recommending the designation of 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road.

This report has been prepared to address that direction pertaining to 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road.

3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road, both in Lindsay, are two adjacent properties near the Scugog River which have been proposed for redevelopment. The Committee believed that the two properties may have some historic importance and completed research on and a windshield survey of the properties to determine if they warranted designation. Through their research, they concluded that the properties adequately fulfil at least one of the criteria which determine significance under the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA). The evaluation of the properties was completed as per the requirements of the OHA and the Committee provided staff with their evaluation and research. The designations are not being put forward at the request of the owner.

Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act provides that, upon consultation with its Municipal Heritage Committee and serving a Notice of Intention to Designate pursuant to the OHA, the Council of a municipality may pass a by-law designating a property within the bounds of a municipality to be of cultural heritage value or interest. However, if it is determined that the properties do not sufficiently fulfil the criteria under Regulation 9/06 of the OHA, Council can also choose not to designate these properties. The Municipal Heritage Committee supports the designation of the subject property under Part IV, s.29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Rationale:

Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies the criteria for determining the cultural heritage value of a property. Under this regulation, a property may be designated under Part IV, s.29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets one or more of the following criteria:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
 - b. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
 - c. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

2. The property has historical value or associative value because it:
 - a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
 - b. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
 - c. demonstrates the work of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.

3. The property has contextual value because it:
 - a. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area,
 - b. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
 - c. is a landmark.

Both properties fulfil at least one of these criteria, but do not fulfil any of the criteria regarding the design or physical value of the property, nor do they form integral parts of an intact heritage neighbourhood. Although not prescribed under the OHA, the Committee and Council also generally takes into account the architectural and structural integrity of the subject properties. Neither property is architecturally or structurally intact and has had significant modifications. Heritage evaluation reports have been prepared which demonstrate which criteria each properties fulfils and provides the necessary background information for each property in order for Council to make its determination. These reports are appended as Appendices A and B. A summary of the heritage value and reasons for designation for each property can be found below.

3 St. David Street: 3 St. David Street is a typical example of a late Victorian gable front house. Likely constructed in the mid-1870s, the property displays the standard characteristics of this type of house including the front facing gable, an offset entrance, two windows on the upper storey of the house, and a verandah. The property's primary significance lies in its historical associations with members of the Lindsay community and the development of the town in the late nineteenth century. Originally part of the Purdy property, its later occupants includes: Joseph Foley, the owner of the first hardware store in Lindsay; William Walker Sadler, son of mill owner Thomas Sadler and the owner of the steamboat the Greyhound; and the Lamantia family, one of Lindsay's early and most prominent Italian families who began their local grocery store in 1928. This history of occupants includes many people who were important to the development of Lindsay's local business community.

4 Riverview Road: 4 Riverview Road has cultural heritage value or interest because of its historical associations with local builder James Growden. Architecturally, the property is a typical example of an Ontario Gothic cottage. Constructed between 1863 and 1875, the house displays the main attributes of this structural type including the gable roof, central gable with rounded window,

and the symmetrical placement of the windows. Its primary significance lies in its historical associations with members of the Lindsay community and the development of Lindsay in the late nineteenth century. The property was occupied, and likely constructed by, local mason and builder James Growden. Growden is a significant local figure as the mason credited with the reconstructed of many commercial buildings in downtown Lindsay after the 1861 fire. They were reconstructed in the Italianate style which now defines the Lindsay's commercial core; Growden had an important role in that development as one of the key workman in the construction process. He was also the mason for a number other important public buildings in late nineteenth and early twentieth century Lindsay.

Other Alternatives Considered:

Council may choose to designate both, one or neither of the properties under the OHA. Under the OHA, Council is not obliged to designate a property recommended by the Municipal Heritage Committee. As the two properties proposed for designation are part of a redevelopment proposal, Council could choose not to designate the properties if it is determined that the properties do not sufficiently fulfil one or more of the Regulation 9/06 criteria or if Council believes that is it more appropriate to address the future of the structures on the subject properties through the redevelopment process. The properties only fulfil historical or associative criteria under the Regulations of the OHA and do not have specific architectural merit.

Staff recommends that, while each building fulfils at least one criteria under the OHA and is therefore eligible for designation under Part IV of the OHA, it is more appropriate to address the properties through the redevelopment process. This would allow for a more flexible approach to the properties which could be reviewed as part of the development of the site plan. At this time, alternatives could be considered as to how to conserve the properties. These may include integration of the buildings within the redevelopment, moving the buildings within the site, or removal of the buildings to another lot.

An alternative resolution for this path is as follows:

That the Committee of the Whole authorizes staff to address the preservation of 3 St. David Street and 4 Riverview Road through the redevelopment process.

Financial/Operation Impacts:

There are advertising costs associated with the designation process which are covered by the Municipal Heritage Committee budget. Should the owner of the properties object to the proposed designations, the properties may be the subject of a Conservation Review Board hearing which would have associated costs.

Relationship of Recommendation(s) to the 2016-2019 Strategic Plan:

Designation of property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act contribute to Goal 1 – A Vibrant and Growing Economy and Goal 2 – An Exceptional Quality of Life because the preservation of heritage properties within the municipality contributes to maintaining a sense of place and community and can contribute to economic growth.

Consultations:

Municipal Heritage Committee

Attachments:

Appendix A – Heritage Evaluation Report: 3 St. David Street



Appendix A 3 St
David Street Designat

Appendix B – Heritage Evaluation Report: 4 Riverview Road



Appendix B 4
Riverview Road Desig

Department Head E-Mail: cmarshall@kawarthalakes.ca

Department Head: Chris Marshall