



Committee of the Whole Report

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Report Number: | ED2022-015 |
| Meeting Date: | April 5, 2022 |
| Title: | Proposed Heritage Designation of 15 Dodd Street, Fenelon Falls |
| Description: | Proposed heritage designation of 15 Dodd Street under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act |
| Author and Title: | Emily Turner, Economic Development Officer – Heritage Planning |

Recommendations:

That Report ED2022-015, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 15 Dodd Street, Fenelon Falls**, be received;

That the Municipal Heritage Committee's recommendation to designate 15 Dodd Street under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as being of cultural heritage value or interest be endorsed;

That staff be authorized to proceed with the process to designate the subject property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, including the preparation and circulation of a Notice of Intention to Designate, and preparation of the designating by-law;

That a designating by-law be brought forward to Council at the next Regular Council Meeting following the end of the notice period; and

That this recommendation be brought forward to Council for consideration at the next Regular Council Meeting.

Department Head: _____

Financial/Legal/HR/Other: _____

Chief Administrative Officer: _____

Background:

The City of Kawartha Lakes designates properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Properties are recommended for designation by their owners, members of the public, local organizations, the Municipal Heritage Committee, Council or staff. Properties proposed for designation are reviewed by the Municipal Heritage Committee, as required by subsection 29(2) of the Ontario Heritage Act, and their recommendation is brought forward to Council under the cover of a staff report.

At its meeting of March 3, 2022, the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee adopted the following resolution:

KLMHC2022-032

Moved By W. Peel

Seconded By I. McKechnie

That Report KLMHC2022-015, **Designation of Property – 15 Dodd Street, Fenelon Falls**, be received;

That the designation of the property known municipally as 15 Dodd Street, Fenelon Falls be endorsed; and

That the recommendation to designate the subject property be forwarded to Council for approval.

Carried

This report addresses that direction.

In June 2021, the owner of the property located at 15 Dodd Street in Fenelon Falls reached out to staff and requested that the property be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The property contains a Regency-style dwelling constructed around 1873 and is currently listed on the City's Heritage Register. Staff undertook a site visit to the property, background research, and heritage evaluation, and have determined that the property is eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act.

Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act provides that, upon consultation with its municipal heritage committee, and after serving a Notice of Intention to Designate pursuant to the requirements of the Act, the Council of a municipality may pass a by-law designating a property within the boundaries of the municipality to be of cultural

heritage value or interest if it fulfils the criteria for designation under the Act, as identified in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Both staff and the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee are satisfied that the subject property fulfils the criteria for designation set out under Ontario Regulation 9/06.

Rationale:

Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies the criteria for determining the cultural heritage value of a property. Under this regulation, a property may be designated under Part IV, s.29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets at least one of the following criteria:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
 - b. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
 - c. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
2. The property has historical value or associative value because it:
 - a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
 - b. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
 - c. demonstrates the work of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.
3. The property has contextual value because it:
 - a. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area,
 - b. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
 - c. is a landmark.

15 Dodd Street fulfils multiple criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and is therefore eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act. A heritage evaluation report has been prepared for this property, which outlines its significance and demonstrates which criteria it fulfils. This report is attached as Appendix A. A statement of significance for the property as required by the Act, which summarizes the property's cultural heritage value and reasons for designation, can be found below.

The heritage evaluation report attached to this report includes a list of heritage attributes for the property, which will be protected in the final by-law, as is standard in City reports. However, the heritage attributes for this property also include interior features, which is not common practice in the City. Generally, interior elements are only protected if they have a high level of significance to the property. In this case, there are several elements in the house which are unique to this property and contribute to the property's cultural heritage value. The property owner has requested that these elements be protected as part of the designation. The protection of these features will not preclude the current or future owners from making changes or renovations to the interior of the property but will serve to protect and retain the specific elements identified in the report.

15 Dodd Street Statement of Significance

Design and Physical Value

The property is a representative example of a Regency-style cottage in Fenelon Falls. Constructed around 1873 as a private residence, the house displays the key architectural characteristics of this style which was at the height of its popularity in Ontario in the early nineteenth century but remained a well-used residential style until the end of the century. These features include its hipped roof, square plan, one-storey elevation, central entrances on both the front and rear of the building, and the French doors on the rear of the house. It is also one of only a few examples of this style in the community as it was not used as extensively in Kawartha Lakes as in other parts of the province.

Historical and Associative Value

15 Dodd Street has historical and associative value as a former cottage hospital which operated in Fenelon Falls beginning around 1895 and in its association with prominent local doctor Archibald Wilson. The property was originally constructed as a residential dwelling but was rented by Wilson from its owner to use as a subscription-based hospital catering primarily to men working in the village from out of town. It yields information on the development of medical care in small town Ontario in the late nineteenth century. Wilson himself was also a prominent and well-known local doctor with a large and respected practice in the village and involvement in a wide range of community organizations.

Contextual Value

15 Dodd Street has contextual value as a contributing property to Dodd Street and the surrounding neighbourhood, which can be identified as a mature residential neighbourhood that has evolved organically from the nineteenth century. The area in which 15 Dodd Street is located is comprised of single family residential properties of approximately one to two storeys on mid-sized lots which range in age from Victorian to modern. 15 Dodd Street fits within this pattern of development and helps contribute to the overall character and feel of the neighbourhood.

Provincial Policy Conformity

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) sets the policy foundation for development and land use planning Ontario. The policy intends to balance the needs of growth and economic development with the need for ensuring a high quality of life, public safety and health, and the conservation of natural and cultural heritage resources. Section 2.6 (Cultural Heritage and Archaeology) requires municipalities to conserve significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes as part of the land use planning process, stating that Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.

Significant built heritage resources, as defined by the PPS, are those which have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest as established by the criteria under the Ontario Heritage Act. These criteria are outlined by Ontario Regulation 9/06. The subject property has been evaluated based on the criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and has been found to fulfil those criteria and, therefore, is a significant heritage resource within the municipality which requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act.

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2019)

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe was prepared by the Ontario government in order to help guide the land use planning process and assist communities within the Greater Golden Horseshoe achieve a high quality of life, positive economic development, and protection for important local resources.

Section 4.2.7 (Cultural Heritage Resources) requires municipalities to conserve their cultural heritage resources as part of the land use planning process in order to foster a sense of place and benefit communities. The Growth Plan defines cultural heritage

resources as built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes, and archaeological resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest for the important contribution that make to our understanding of the history of a place, event, or a people. While some cultural heritage resources may already be identified and inventoried by official sources, the significance of others can only be determined after evaluation.

The subject property has been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest through evaluation based on Ontario Regulation 9/06 and therefore requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act. This property has a high degree of historic significance with regard to the history of Fenelon Falls in the late nineteenth century and community benefit would be gained through its ongoing preservation.

City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan (2012)

The City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan was amended in 2017 to include strengthened cultural heritage policies. Official Plan Amendment 26 outlined those amendments.

Three of the heritage policies speak directly to the conservation of individual heritage properties:

- a) Cultural heritage resources of significant cultural heritage value or interest shall be identified, protected and conserved.
- e) The City shall use the tools available to it under the Municipal Act, the Planning Act, the Environmental Assessment Act, and the Ontario Heritage Act to conserve cultural heritage resources.
- f) Cultural heritage resources shall be maintained in situ and in a manner that prevents the deterioration and conserved the identified cultural heritage values or interest and/or identified heritage attributes of the cultural heritage resource.

The City's policies require it to conserve cultural heritage resources and designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act is a tool for doing so. In this case, the subject property has been found to have cultural heritage value through evaluation and individual designation is the most appropriate method for ensuring its conservation.

Other Alternatives Considered:

There are no recommended alternatives.

Alignment to Strategic Priorities

The designation of property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act supports the following goals from the Council adopted Strategic Plan:

- A Vibrant and Growing Economy
- An Exceptional Quality of Life

The identification and protection of heritage assets in the community through designation promotes an exceptional quality of life by supporting and promoting arts, culture and heritage within the municipality. Designation provides long term protection and management for key heritage resources in the municipality and recognizes their importance to the community.

The protection of heritage resources in the municipality also assists in the growth of the local economy in general by identifying, protecting, and celebrating places where people want to live, work and visit. It encourages investment in local communities by ensuring and promoting attractive places for residents and businesses to be. It also has a direct impact on developing local tourism through the preservation of sites and landscapes that people want to visit.

Financial/Operation Impacts:

There will be costs associated with the provision of public notice and for the registration of the designation by-law associated with this application which are covered by the existing Heritage Planning budget.

Consultations:

Municipal Heritage Committee
Property Owner

Attachments:

Appendix A – Heritage Evaluation Report: 15 Dodd Street, Fenelon Falls



Adobe Acrobat
Document

Department Head email: rholy@kawarthalakes.ca

Department Head: Richard Holy, Director of Development Services