

Old Mill HCD 2023 Evaluation

Amendments made to the Ontario Heritage Act through Bill 23, More Homes Built Faster Act (2022), established new criteria for evaluating heritage conservation districts. These criteria are established through subsection 3(2) of Ontario Regulation 9/06 and are outlined in the table below. At least 25% of the properties within the heritage conservation district must meet two or more of the criteria for the area to be eligible for designation. As there were no transition provisions for heritage conservation district studies already in process, any heritage conservation districts currently in development must be re-evaluated to ensure they fulfill the new criteria prescribed under the Act.

The following is an evaluation of the area within the recommended boundary endorsed by Council in July 2022 which included 266 properties. The majority of these properties are residential properties dating from between approximately 1850 and 1940, but also include several commercial and institutional properties within the neighbourhood. The proposed district, recommended in 2022, fulfils six of the nine criteria prescribed by the province.

Design and Physical Value		
Criterion	Yes/No	Significance
The properties have design value or physical value because they are rare, unique, representative or early examples of a style, type, expression, material or construction method.	Yes	<p>The study area is representative of vernacular housing in Lindsay dating from the mid-nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century. The plurality of properties in the study area are vernacular properties constructed prior to 1940 which are reflective of the many and diverse residents who have lived in the area. This high level of concentration of historic properties of this type is important as a representative example of worker's housing which is less likely to be preserved than larger, more ornate examples from the same period. These properties are themselves architecturally diverse, but all fall within the wider category of vernacular properties. There are 109 vernacular residential properties in the area which comprises approximately 41% of the properties within the area.</p> <p>The area also contains a substantial and diverse range of Victorian and Edwardian housing and is representative of the wide range of housing types and styles used in Lindsay in its historic</p>

		<p>development from the mid-nineteenth century onward. Although there are a variety of different styles used, they are representative of the wider trends in late nineteenth and early twentieth century residential design which included an eclectic array of styles and expressions. Not including the vernacular housing types identified above, these housing styles include:</p> <p>Generic Victorian: 23 Edwardian Classical: 20 Gothic Revival: 7 Georgian: 8 Italianate: 6 Neoclassical: 5 Queen Anne: 4 Regency: 10 Twentieth-century Revivals: 3</p> <p>Overall, there are 86 Victorian and Edwardian properties, which comprise 32% of properties within the district.</p> <p>Taken together, this wide array of historic properties includes 195 properties or 73% of the properties within the district boundary as a whole.</p>
The properties have design value or physical value because they display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.	No	The level of craftsmanship varies throughout the district dependant on the property.
The properties have design value or physical value because they display a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	No	There are no known specific technical or scientific achievements associated with any of the extant properties throughout the study area.

Historical and Associative Value		
Criterion	Yes/No	Significance

<p>The properties have historical or associative value because they have a direct association with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The Old Mill neighbourhood has direct associations with several themes and institutions which are significant to the history of both the local area and of Lindsay as a whole.</p> <p>1. Purdy's Mills The neighbourhood is the earliest area of settlement in Lindsay and is associated with the first grist mill built by William Purdy between 1829 and 1831. This was the first mill built in what would become the Town of Lindsay and was intended to serve the wider rural community. The construction of the mill served as the catalyst for urban settlement around the mill site. Beginning in the 1830s, a community developed around the mill site and was eventually annexed the town of Lindsay which was surveyed immediately adjacent to Purdy's lands. The neighbourhood was both the first industrial development in Lindsay and its first residential neighbourhood. The mill development also had a significant impact on the wider landscape through its flooding of the Scugog River system, creating the larger river of the present day and Lake Scugog itself, as well as flooding out settler's fields and indigenous wild rice beds further to the south. Within the area, 13 properties relate directly to this theme as properties constructed prior to the creation of Lindsay in 1857 as the majority of properties from this period were demolished and replaced in the second half of the nineteenth century and early twentieth century. These properties comprise approximately 5% of the existing properties in this neighbourhood.</p> <p>2. St. Mary's Catholic Church</p>
---	------------	--

The neighbourhood has direct associations with the Catholic Church in Lindsay. St. Mary's Catholic Church, located in the study area, is the oldest and only Catholic Church in Lindsay with a history in the area dating back to the early 1840s. It, as well as its associated structures, is an important local institution with a long-standing presence in the community. The church and its strong associations with the neighbourhood also speak to the significant Irish community in the area who were many of the founding families of the church and formed the largest ethno-cultural group within the church in the nineteenth century. Because exact census data noting the religious affiliation for all households in the area over time is not available, an exact percentage of properties which fulfil this criterion is not known.

3. Industrial Development

Beginning with the first Purdy mill in the 1830s, the neighbourhood has had a strong association with industrial development, likely because of its proximity to the river. Industry developed along the length of the river through Lindsay in the second half of the nineteenth century, including in the study area which hosted several different industries during this period. The area is also associated with this theme because of the large amount of vernacular housing used by working class families in Lindsay in both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The area includes 109 vernacular residential properties, which comprise 41% of properties within the proposed district.

<p>The properties have historical or associative value because they yield or have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of the history of a community or culture.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The entire study area is located in an area of high archaeological potential due to its location on the Scugog River and its role as the original area of settlement in Lindsay. There is the potential for archaeological resources from both indigenous and non-indigenous communities in this area which has the potential to yield information regarding both indigenous and settler communities in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. While the evolution of the area and the significant history of construction in this area mean that many sites are potentially disturbed, the potential for archaeological finds remains high. These include indigenous pre-settlement sites, early settlement sites, and industrial sites.</p> <p>All of the properties within the study are have this potential, although those in within 300m of the Scugog River hold the highest potential for archaeological resources in accordance with the province's criteria for evaluating archaeological potential.</p>
<p>The properties have historical or associative value because they demonstrate or reflects the work or ideas of a planner, architect, landscape architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The organic evolution of the neighbourhood means that it does not reflect the work of any one architect, builder or planner.</p>

Contextual Value		
Criterion	Yes/No	Significance
<p>The properties have contextual value because they define,</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The character of the area can be defined as that of a mature historic residential area that is defined by its diverse historic residential properties spanning a period</p>

<p>maintain or support the character of the district.</p>		<p>from approximately 1850 to 1940. The district area includes 195 historic residential properties that contribute to this overall character. These properties are all constructed in a range of Victorian and Edwardian residential styles and, taken together, form a cohesive cultural heritage landscape. Individually, these properties define, maintain and support this character. These properties comprise 73% of the properties within the proposed district boundary.</p>
<p>The properties have contextual value because they are physically, functionally or historically linked to each other.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The built and natural landscape of the area are connected as part of the development of the neighbourhood from the 1830s to the present day. The neighbourhood is historically and contextually linked to its natural surroundings by virtue of the fact that it developed around a mill site on the river. The residential properties are also contextually linked to the Old Mill itself which is an important community landmark and a key aspect of the area's history.</p> <p>73% of the properties have been identified as contributing properties to the proposed future district and these properties are linked historically together as part of the organic residential development of the area and functionally as residential properties.</p>
<p>The properties have contextual value because they are defined by, planned around or are themselves a landmark.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The neighbourhood is defined by its relationship to the Scugog River both historically and in the contemporary context. The river was the catalyst for its establishment and development because of the construction of the mill on the river within the study area. The river is a major landmark in the town of Lindsay and had a significant impact on the development of this neighbourhood. The entirety of the neighbourhood is defined by this landmark.</p>

		<p>The neighbourhood is also defined by its relationship to the Old Mill. Although it is not the original mill from the Purdy period, the mill is an important landmark around which the community developed. Successive mills in this area were key economic and demographic drivers, bringing people into Lindsay and spurring additional development. The neighbourhood exists because of the mill and its predecessors and maintains the contextual connection to it and all of the historic residential properties in the area are defined by their relationship to the mill; this includes 195 properties, comprising 73% of the properties in the proposed district boundaries.</p>
--	--	--