



## Committee of the Whole Report

---

**Report Number:** ED2023-031

**Meeting Date:** September 12, 2023

**Title:** **Proposed Heritage Designation of 13-19 Colborne Street, Village of Fenelon Falls (McArthur Block)**

**Description:** Proposed heritage designation of 13-19 Colborne Street under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act

**Author and Title:** Emily Turner, Economic Development Officer – Heritage Planning

---

### Recommendations:

**That** Report ED2023-031, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 13-19 Colborne Street, Village of Fenelon Falls (McArthur Block)**, be received;

**That** the Municipal Heritage Committee’s recommendation to designate 13 Colborne Street, 15 Colborne Street, 17 Colborne Street and 19 Colborne Street under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as being of cultural heritage value or interest be endorsed;

**That** staff be authorized to proceed with the process to designate the subject properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, including the preparation and circulation of Notices of Intention to Designate, and preparation of the designating by-laws; and

**That** this recommendation be brought forward to Council for consideration at the next Regular Council Meeting.

**Department Head:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Financial/Legal/HR/Other:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Chief Administrative Officer:** \_\_\_\_\_

## **Background:**

The City of Kawartha Lakes designates properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Properties are recommended for designation by their owners, members of the public, local organizations, the Municipal Heritage Committee, Council or staff. Properties proposed for designation are reviewed by the Municipal Heritage Committee, as required by subsection 29(2) of the Ontario Heritage Act, and their recommendation is brought forward to Council under the cover of a staff report.

13-19 Colborne Street, also known as the McArthur Block and constructed in 1886, is a historic Italianate commercial block in downtown Fenelon Falls. The property is currently listed on the City's Heritage Register. Although there was initially no intention by staff to designate this building under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act made through Bill 23, More Homes Built Faster Act (2022) now require municipalities to designate listed properties or remove them from the Register within two years of the amendments coming into effect. Practically, this means that, in order for municipalities to provide heritage protection to its cultural heritage resources as is required by provincial land use planning policy, they must be designated under Part IV of the Act. The amendments came into effect on January 1, 2023.

13-19 Colborne Street has been prioritized as a downtown commercial block that is an integral aspect of the historic downtown streetscape of Fenelon Falls. It has a high degree of architectural and historical value in the village. This property was identified by the Municipal Heritage Committee as a priority property and was reviewed and evaluated as part of a larger examination of heritage properties in downtown Fenelon Falls as a whole. Staff have undertaken a site visit to and heritage evaluation report about the property and have determined that the property is eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act.

13-19 Colborne Street was originally constructed as a single building on one parcel but had now been subdivided into four commercial units that are owned independently from one another. The municipal addresses of these properties are: 13 Colborne Street, 15 Colborne Street, 17 Colborne Street, and 19 Colborne Street. Because these four properties together form a single building, the heritage evaluation report has been prepared collectively for the building as a whole. However, the properties will each be

designated by their own by-law to be registered on title for each property and the owner of each property circulated separately with the relevant notices.

At its meeting of August 4, 2023, the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee reviewed the heritage evaluation report for this property and adopted the following resolution:

**KLMHC2023-092**

**Moved By** I. McKechnie

**Seconded By** Councillor Ashmore

**That** Report KLMHC2023-49, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 13-19 Colborne Street, Village of Fenelon Falls**, be received;

**That** the designation of the properties known municipally as 13 Colborne Street, 15 Colborne Street, 17 Colborne Street and 19 Colborne Street be endorsed; and

**That** the recommendation to designate the subject properties be forwarded to Council for approval.

**Carried**

This report addresses that direction.

Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act provides that, upon consultation with its municipal heritage committee, and after serving a Notice of Intention to Designate pursuant to the requirements of the Act, the Council of a municipality may pass a by-law designating a property within the boundaries of the municipality to be of cultural heritage value or interest if it fulfils the criteria for designation under the Act, as identified in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Both staff and the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee are satisfied that the subject property fulfils the criteria for designation set out under Ontario Regulation 9/06.

**Rationale:**

Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies the criteria for determining the cultural heritage value of a property. Under this regulation, a property may be designated under Part IV, s.29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets at least two of the following criteria:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:

- a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
  - b. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
  - c. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
2. The property has historical value or associative value because it:
- a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
  - b. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
  - c. demonstrates the work of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.
3. The property has contextual value because it:
- a. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area,
  - b. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
  - c. is a landmark.

Amendments made to the Ontario Heritage Act under Bill 23 require a property to meet two or more criteria in order to be eligible for designation. 13-19 Colborne Street fulfils multiple criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and is therefore eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act. A heritage evaluation report has been prepared for this property which outlines its significance and demonstrates which criteria it fulfils. This report is attached as Appendix A. A statement of significance for the property as required by the Act, which summarizes the property's cultural heritage value and reasons for designation, can be found below.

### **13-19 Colborne Street Statement of Significance**

#### **Design and Physical Value**

13-19 Colborne Street has design and physical value as a representative example of Italianate commercial architecture in downtown Fenelon Falls and the largest extant nineteenth century commercial block in the community. The building, which was constructed in 1886 as a replacement for an older commercial block, demonstrates the key features of this architectural style which was the most popular architecture style for commercial construction in Ontario in the second half of the nineteenth century. It is

representative of the execution of this style in Fenelon Falls between about 1870 and 1890 when it was at its height of popularity and the commercial core of the village was developing rapidly from its pioneer beginnings to an established Victorian community.

### **Historical and Associative Attributes**

13-19 Colborne Street, also known as the McArthur Block, has historical and associative value in its historic relationship to the development of downtown Fenelon Falls throughout the 1870s and 1880s. Throughout this period, the community underwent a period of rapidly increasing prosperity that attracted new businesses, residents and investment into the community. This property is a result of that period of prosperity and yields information regarding Fenelon Falls' economic growth near the end of the nineteenth century. Similarly, the property also has direct associations with prominent local businessman and politician, Joseph McArthur, the original owner of the building. Throughout the second half of the nineteenth century, McArthur was a major player in the economic and political development of Fenelon Falls and is an important individual in the nineteenth century history of the community.

### **Contextual Value**

13-19 Colborne Street has contextual value as a contributing feature to the historic commercial streetscape of downtown Fenelon Falls. The property, which is historically, visually and historically linked to its surroundings as part of the continuous commercial streetwall along the west side of Colborne Street, maintains and supports the historic commercial character of the village's downtown area which is characterized by its collection of Italianate commercial architecture dating primarily from the 1870s and 1880s. The downtown area includes a variety of late nineteenth century Italianate properties executed in a similar style, size and massing to the subject property which, taken together, form a cohesive downtown landscape of which 13-19 Colborne Street is a contributing feature.

## **Provincial Policy Conformity**

### **Provincial Policy Statement (2020)**

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) sets the policy foundation for development and land use planning Ontario. The policy intends to balance the needs of growth and economic development with the need for ensuring a high quality of life, public safety and health, and the conservation of natural and cultural heritage resources. Section 2.6 (Cultural Heritage and Archaeology) requires municipalities to conserve significant built

heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes as part of the land use planning process, stating that “Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.”

Significant built heritage resources, as defined by the PPS, are those which have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest as established by the criteria under the Ontario Heritage Act. These criteria are outlined by Ontario Regulation 9/06. The subject property has been evaluated based on the criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and has been found to fulfil those criteria and, therefore, is a significant heritage resource within the municipality which requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act.

**A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2019)**

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe was prepared by the Ontario government in order to help guide the land use planning process and assist communities within the Greater Golden Horseshoe achieve a high quality of life, positive economic development, and protection for important local resources.

Section 4.2.7 (Cultural Heritage Resources) requires municipalities to conserve their cultural heritage resources as part of the land use planning process “in order to foster a sense of place and benefit communities”. The Growth Plan defines cultural heritage resources as “built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes, and archaeological resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest for the important contribution that make to our understanding of the history of a place, event, or a people. While some cultural heritage resources may already be identified and inventoried by official sources, the significance of others can only be determined after evaluation.”

The subject property has been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest through evaluation based on Ontario Regulation 9/06 and therefore requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act. This property has a high degree of historic significance with regard to the history of Fenelon Falls as a key contributing feature to the downtown streetscape and community benefit would be gained through its ongoing preservation.

**City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan (2012)**

The City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan was amended in 2017 to include strengthened cultural heritage policies. Official Plan Amendment 26 outlined those amendments.

Three of the heritage policies speak directly to the conservation of individual heritage properties:

- a) Cultural heritage resources of significant cultural heritage value or interest shall be identified, protected and conserved.
- e) The City shall use the tools available to it under the Municipal Act, the Planning Act, the Environmental Assessment Act, and the Ontario Heritage Act to conserve cultural heritage resources.
- f) Cultural heritage resources shall be maintained in situ and in a manner that prevents the deterioration and conserved the identified cultural heritage values or interest and/or identified heritage attributes of the cultural heritage resource.

The City's policies require it to conserve cultural heritage resources and designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act is a tool for doing so. In this case, the subject property has been found to have cultural heritage value through evaluation and individual designation is the most appropriate method for ensuring its conservation.

### **Other Alternatives Considered:**

There are no recommended alternatives. Amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act now require municipalities to review and designate their listed properties and the City is required to follow provincial direction.

### **Alignment to Strategic Priorities**

The designation of property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act supports the following goals from the Council adopted Strategic Plan:

- A Vibrant and Growing Economy
- An Exceptional Quality of Life

The identification and protection of heritage assets in the community through designation promotes and exceptional quality of life by supporting and promoting arts, culture and heritage within the municipality. Designation provides long term protection and management for key heritage resources in the municipality and recognizes their importance to the community.

The protection of heritage resources in the municipality also assists in the growth of the local economy in general by identifying, protecting, and celebrating places where people want to live, work and visit. It encourages investment in local communities by ensuring and promoting attractive places for residents and businesses to be. It also has a direct impact on developing local tourism through the preservation of sites and landscapes that people want to visit.

### **Financial/Operation Impacts:**

There will be costs associated with the provision of public notice and for the registration of the designation by-law associated with this application which are included in the 2023 Heritage Planning budget.

It is possible that there will be any additional legal fees if there is an owner-initiated appeal to the Ontario Land Tribunal as the property is privately owned. There is also the potential for third-party appeals of the designation to the Ontario Land Tribunal; however, appeals of this nature are rare.

### **Consultations:**

Municipal Heritage Committee.

### **Attachments:**

Appendix A – Heritage Evaluation Report: 13-19 Colborne Street



Adobe Acrobat  
Document

**Department Head email:** [rholy@kawarthalakes.ca](mailto:rholy@kawarthalakes.ca)

**Department Head:** Richard Holy, Director of Development Services