

21-25 Colborne Street, Village of Fenelon Falls

Heritage Designation Evaluation

Fenelon Falls

PT LT 3 W/S COLBORNE ST PL 17 FENELON AS IN R186481 S/T & T/W
R186481; KAWARTHA LAKES

PT LT 3 W/S COLBORNE ST PL 17 FENELON AS IN A1990, S/T & T/W A1990;
KAWARTHA LAKES

PT LT 3 W/S COLBORNE ST PL 17 FENELON AS IN R372405, S/T & T/W
R372405; S/T R425901

2023



Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The subject property has been researched and evaluated in order to determine its cultural heritage significance under Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act R.S.O. 1990. A property is eligible for designation if it has physical, historical, associative or contextual value and meets any two of the nine criteria set out under Regulation 9/06 of the Act. A heritage evaluation of the property has determined that 21-25 Colborne Street has cultural heritage value or interest and merits designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:

i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method:

21-25 Colborne Street is a representative example of commercial Italianate architecture in downtown Fenelon Falls. This style was the most popular architectural style for urban commercial buildings in the second half of the nineteenth century, both in Fenelon Falls and in communities across Ontario. It demonstrates the key features of this style which include two-storey construction, ornate brick coursing, pilasters, and a multi-unit structure with three distinct ground floor commercial units.

ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit:

The property displays a typical degree of craftsmanship for a building of this type.

iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement:

There are no specific technical or scientific achievements associated with this property.

2. The property has historical or associative value because it:

i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to the community:

The property has direct associations with the history and development of downtown Fenelon Falls throughout the 1870s and 1880s. This was a period when the community was growing in prosperity and the subject property speaks directly to this period of growth. The property also has specific historical associations through its commercial tenants, namely the continued use, from 1888, of 21 Colborne Street as a pharmacy and the former use of 23-25 Colborne Street as Burgoyne's Dry Goods Store, a prominent local retailer.

ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture:

The property yields information regarding the development of Fenelon Falls throughout the 1870s and 1880s and the increasing prosperity and urbanization in the village during this time.

iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community:

The designer and builder of this property are not known.

3. The property has contextual value because it:

i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area:

The property is important in maintaining and supporting the historic commercial character of downtown Fenelon as one of a collection of late nineteenth century Italianate buildings that define the commercial core of the community which is primarily located along Colborne Street.

ii. is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings:

The property is historically, functionally, physically and visually linked to its surroundings as part of a collection of extant Italianate commercial buildings which form the commercial core of Fenelon Falls. The building forms part of continuous streetwall along the west side of Colborne Street comprised of late nineteenth century Italianate structures.

iii. is a landmark.

The property is not a specific landmark.

Design and Physical Value

21-25 Colborne Street has design and physical value as a representative example of Italianate commercial architecture in Fenelon Falls. The building, which was constructed between 1884 and 1888 as a replacement for an older commercial block, demonstrates the key features of this architectural style which was the most popular architecture style for commercial construction in Ontario in the second half of the nineteenth century. It is representative of the execution of this style in Fenelon Falls between about 1870 and 1890 when it was at its height of popularity and the commercial core of the village was developing rapidly from its pioneer beginnings to an established Victorian community.

Commercial architecture in Canada's cities, towns and villages, including Fenelon Falls, underwent a period of significant evolution throughout the nineteenth century. The earliest commercial architecture was purely functional, such as small general stores or blacksmith's shops in nascent communities where the proprietors would build a structure, often in a vernacular style, near or adjacent to their residence. As the century wore on, these structures often took on the stylistic trappings of contemporary architectural styles, but remained relatively basic detached structures on their own lots. A new structural type also developed: a two-storey structure with the commercial establishment on the main floor and the business owner's residence on the upper storey. Architecturally, these buildings still generally resembled residential structures although the ground floor would often have larger window to showcase the store's products. This type of arrangement was, and remained, typical for small hamlets with a few commercial enterprises.

However, with the increasing urbanization of many of the province's communities, commercial architecture was forced to adapt to the rapidly changing conditions of Ontario's towns and cities; this change was not limited to Ontario and is reflective of the condition of commercial structures across North America. One of the most significant changes was the centralization of commercial structures together in downtown areas. Although the concept of formal zoning was just being developed during this period, it was a time when commercial enterprises and work were being moved outside of the home and businesses were beginning to establish their own spaces in communities; as had and was continuing to occur in urban centres in Europe, businesses naturally clustered together for convenience, creating the beginnings of the commercial downtown and the idea of a main street.

As more businesses came together to form a downtown core, their buildings began to get closer together to respond to the increasing density and desire to not waste limited space. By the mid-century, the idea of commercial buildings being linked in a continuous street wall was common in urban areas as commercial structures were built directly adjacent to one another and even

shared dividing walls. This arrangement was a direct mirror of European urban spaces where tightly packed commercial cores necessitated buildings attached to one another, and built directly to the edge of the lot to maximize space. In the early days of this new commercial arrangement, two types of buildings prevailed. The first were two- to three storey buildings similar to a basic Georgian plan, and often with a gable roof divided by a parapet wall, forming a continuous gable along the street; good examples of this type of structure can be seen in Kingston where a substantial portion of the downtown developed during this time. Like their predecessors, these invariably included commercial space on the ground floor with residential space on the second and third storeys; the third storey was often located in the gable and included dormer windows for light. This was a continuation of the two-part commercial block which had developed in the first part of the nineteenth century. The second was the use of false facades to create the look of a much taller building when in fact, a flat rectangular façade was applied to a much smaller, generally gable roofed structure behind it. These were usually built in wood and located in areas where erecting a large commercial building was not feasible. Examples of this type of commercial architecture are less common because they were often replaced with larger brick buildings, but there are extant examples in Kawartha Lakes, particularly in Bethany where several of these structures are still standing. In both types, the idea of the storefront had developed with large windows and often a recessed entrance to show off products and entice shoppers inside. Whichever form of architecture they used, these mid-century streetscapes were often an eclectic mix of architectural forms but represented the shift towards a highly urbanized downtown with densely packed buildings, a continuous street wall and distinctive commercial architecture separate from purely residential spaces.

By the late 1850s, a new architectural style had evolved to respond to the need for urban commercial space. The Italianate style had become popular in residential architecture integrated elements from Italian and other European Renaissance architecture into eclectic and often exaggerated combinations. Features such as columns and pilasters were common, as well as wide eaves with decorative brackets, decorative brick and iron work and arched windows with elaborate hoods and surrounds. Increasing mobility and the growth of pattern books allowed people in North America to see and experience European architecture and it was increasingly something seen as being desirable to imitate and adapt for the North American context.

This style was quickly adapted into commercial architecture where its decorative elements could be easily applied to the facades of downtown structures. With the high density of commercial buildings, and the fact that they now shared walls, the front façade of the structure was the only one that was seen from the street. As a result, builders and architects focussed on this

side of the structure as the focal point for decoration and ornamentation. The space for this type of work on these buildings was substantial: the increasing density of urban downtown necessitated buildings going up, instead of out, and by the 1860s, the majority of commercial buildings in downtown areas were two to four storeys, high enough to create upper storey residential or, by this time, office space, but still short enough to allow a person to comfortably ascend to the top storey by the stairs. This gave architects several storeys, albeit only on one side, of a building to craft ornate and decorative spaces

By the 1860s, a new standard form for downtown commercial buildings had fully emerged. These buildings, which like their predecessors were linked together in a continuous streetwall, were generally two to four storeys in height with commercial space on the ground floor and residential or office space upstairs. The commercial space on the ground floor generally included large plate glass windows and a recessed entrance which allowed for a substantial amount of display area visible from the street. This was not always the case for non-retail establishments such as hotels where the ground floor might have been used as a tavern so required a different orientation and focus and less visibility to the interior. The upper storeys were generally similar to one another with bands of tall sash windows differentiating each floor and the façade often divided into repeating bays by pilasters. These upper storeys also included extensive decorative elements, such as decorative brickwork in a variety of patterns, elaborate window hoods and large and heavy cornices. A flat, or gently sloping, roof was hidden behind the cornice. When placed together as part of a block of these structures, each individual building was distinct, but fit into a wider cohesive whole with consistent styling and massing.

Technological advancements were integral in making this style, and its widespread adoption, possible. Advances in glass manufacturing made the glass storefront possible, with newer larger pieces of plate glass facilitating the substantial expanses of glass necessary for the large uninterrupted windows. The elaborate ornamentation was also made possible by advances in cast iron manufacturing technology which allowed for the creation of prefabricated metalwork that could be ordered and applied to a building's surface and were substantially cheaper than bespoke and handmade decorative features. Most of the elaborate cornices and window hoods were made in this way and prefabrication allowed for consistent decoration to be applied across the façade of a structure. At the same time, increased mechanization in brick manufacturing made large quantities of brick available for use on structures of this size.

The redevelopment of many downtowns across Ontario in this style was not gradual and occurred rapidly between the 1860s and 1880s, although Italianate commercial buildings were still being constructed, although with less

regularity, into the 1890s. Many business and property owners were eager to adopt the new style and it quickly gained popularity as the go-to style for new commercial architecture. The late Victorian era was where architectural style was seen as being imbued with meaning, and Italianate commercial architecture was no exception. Italianate architecture, similar to other Neoclassical forms, was often associated with business and commerce due to its historical connection with ancient Greece and Rome, as well as the commercial centres of Renaissance-era Italy. Therefore, it was seen as an appropriate style for commercial downtown buildings, in a similar way that the Gothic Revival style was seen to be appropriate for ecclesiastical buildings because of its wider historic and conceptual associations with medieval Christianity. Similarly, the style very quickly came to represent a prosperous and economically vibrant community and to create a sense of permanence and confidence in the urban commercial landscape. As a result, business owners wanted to construct these types of buildings to help demonstrate their successes and promote an image of a prosperous community which, by extension, would increase visitation and investment in a community.

While the cost of buildings structures of this type was substantially decreased by the development of prefabricated decorative elements and mass produced bricks, it was still expensive to erect a building of this type. Many business owners were keen to develop blocks of these structures in concert to provide a consistent aesthetic throughout a downtown area, but it represented a substantial financial investment in building stock. Fire often provided the impetus, and the opportunity, for redevelopment and the application of a consistent architectural style and size across an entire connected streetscape. Many early commercial downtowns were built with a substantial number of wooden buildings which made fire a highly destructive and often inevitable occurrence. However, faced with the need to rebuilt from the ground up, business owners were able to consistent apply the Italianate style across their buildings which, while not exactly the same, were built in tandem to create a consistent aesthetic across an entire downtown area. This was what occurred in Fenelon Falls in the 1880s after a substantial fire on the west side of Colborne Street in 1884 and this story was repeated in communities across Ontario. In fact, this process was even recognized by the *Fenelon Falls Gazette* which wrote in 1894 that “great improvements have been made in the village, particularly on the main street, where each of the oft-reoccurring fires was follows by the erection of brick buildings in the place of those destroyed.”¹ The Italianate streetscape is representative of a second generation of buildings having evolved from more modest structures in the early and mid-nineteenth century to a fully formed and mature downtown architectural landscape.

¹ “Of Age,” *Fenelon Falls Gazette*, February 23, 1894, 4.

21-25 Colborne Street was constructed in this context. Very little is actually known about its early construction history, although it has been definitively recorded as being in place in 1888 and it is undoubtedly a second generation building on this site. The adjacent McArthur block was constructed in 1886 and it may have also been constructed around this time; although the fire of 1884 had less of an impact on the buildings south of Francis Street, the mid-1880s was a period of mass rebuilding in Fenelon Falls and it can be assumed that it was reconstructed around this time, along with its neighbour. Nothing is known about older buildings that occupied this site, but it was likely constructed in wood, as were many of the other buildings in downtown Fenelon Falls prior to the 1884 fire.

The new brick block erected, likely at some point in the mid-1880s, was a two storey buff brick block with three storefronts of identical widths. The rear of the block was constructed in stone; this was likely taken from the construction of the canal and indicates a date of construction mostly likely between 1882 and 1886, when work on the canal was ongoing and substantial amount of stone being removed from the new waterway were used in a number of buildings in downtown Fenelon Falls, including the adjacent McArthur block, the livery stables associated with the McArthur House Hotel, and the Jordan block on the northwest corner of the intersection of Colborne and Francis Streets. As with many commercial buildings erected at this time that used stone as a building material, the stone was only used on the rear of the structure, in order to design the front in the pervasive Italianate commercial style, where the use of brick was integral to many of the patterns and design motifs erected in this style.

As with other commercial blocks along Colborne Street erected during this period, the subject property was constructed in the Italianate style and is representative of how the style was executed in small towns across Ontario in the late nineteenth century. The building, which has been substantially modified since it was originally constructed, included a range of decorative elements in executed in brick; although many Italianate buildings at this time made ample use of decorative prefabricated metal elements, this was not the case in Fenelon Falls, or more communities in Kawartha Lakes, where brick was more commonly used for decorative architectural features. Most of these elements are still visible on the middle commercial unit of the building, now addressed as 23 Colborne Street, where the brick façade of the building remains visible, although it has been painted from its natural brick colour. These decorative elements include dog tooth coursing between the first and second floors, pilasters, decorative brick moulding along the cornice line, and a recessed Victorian storefront with large plate glass windows on the ground floor elevation. Each commercial unit has two upper storey windows, which were originally rounded sash windows with decorative hoods; these have since

been modified heavily. Both commercial units at 21 and 25 Colborne Street have been clad in alternative material and their storefronts have been flattened; nevertheless, their size and massing maintains the typical rhythm of Victorian storefronts and Italianate commercial buildings dating from the second half of the nineteenth century.

In comparison to other Italianate buildings constructed in Fenelon Falls during the 1870s and 1880s, which includes a substantial percentage of the building along Colborne Street in the village's historic downtown, 21-25 Colborne Street is a representative example, despite its more contemporary modifications. It demonstrates the typical Victorian storefront and Italianate decorative massing through its middle unit, while the collection of three contiguous storefronts constructed as a single block was typical for nineteenth century commercial construction where landlords typically built commercial blocks with multiple units to rent out to various businesses. It is also consistent with its neighbours and contemporaries with regard to building matter with its brick front façade and stone rear, a response to its specific geographic and temporal context seen in other buildings in Fenelon Falls' downtown core constructed in the 1880s. Responding to the development of the style in the mid-nineteenth century and the evolving nature of urbanized downtown areas across Ontario, the building is demonstrative of commercial buildings constructed during this period through its style, massing and decorative elements.

Historical and Associative Value

21-25 Colborne Street has historical and associative value in its historic relationship to the development of downtown Fenelon Falls throughout the 1870s and 1880s. Throughout this period, the community underwent a period of rapidly increasing prosperity that attracted new businesses, residents and investment into the community. This property is a subject of that period of prosperity and yields information regarding Fenelon Falls' economic growth near the end of the nineteenth century. The property has direct and specific associations with a number of prominent late nineteenth and early twentieth century businesses that occupied its different units, specifically the longstanding and continuing use of 21 Colborne Street as a pharmacy and the former use of both 23 and 25 Colborne Street as Burgoyne's Dry Goods Store.

Fenelon Falls developed at the juncture of Cameron and Sturgeon Lakes along the short section of water now known as the Fenelon River. Prior to settlement, water flowed out of Cameron Lake over an approximately 7-metre-high falls through a rocky gorge before entering into Sturgeon Lake just under a kilometre away. The drop and current at this site made it an ideal location for a mill site and, in 1841, a grist mill was constructed on the future site of the community by early settlers James Wallis and Robert Jamieson whose land

grants, made in the early 1830s, had included large portions of the current village site.

Wallis and Jamieson were the primary business drivers and community developers in what would eventually become Fenelon Falls throughout the 1840s, building store, taverns, and the new Church of England, as well as severing lots for building. The first bridge was built across the river around this time and corduroy roads gradually built to hamlets and rural settlements in the surrounding area

By 1851, the mill was demolished and replaced with separate grist and saw mills; it was also at this time that the first steamers arrived in Fenelon Falls, with the arrival of the Woodman out of Port Perry in 1851 on her maiden voyage. By this time, the lumber industry was rapidly developing in Kawartha Lakes and Fenelon Falls was well situated to take advantage of its economic benefits, with a prime location on the Fenelon River for transporting timber and mills for processing. New residents and businesses arrived and the community grew steadily throughout the 1850s and 1860s, with its population reaching about 300 people by 1865, and by the early 1870s, three large lumber mills operated in the village, processing millions of feet of pine annually.

The 1870s brought a major change for the community: the arrival of the railway. The Victoria Railway was chartered in 1872 with the intention of joining Lindsay by rail to the northern townships, Haliburton County, and, eventually, the projected Canadian Pacific Railway near Mattawa. Despite early political and financial hurdles, the line began construction in Lindsay in 1874 and soon reached Fenelon Falls. Over the next several years, construction continued north before the line ended at the final terminus in Haliburton village.

As in communities across Ontario, the arrival of the railway was a major economic boon for the community and struck off a period of rapid growth in Fenelon Falls. Not only did the railway make access easier to the community from the wider region, it also allowed for products to be transported in and out of the village and bolstered Fenelon Falls' growing industrial base, particularly with regard to dressed lumber which was overtaking squared timber, usually transported by water, as the preferred wood product and required transport by rail. Fenelon Falls was undoubtedly a lumber town prior to the arrival of the railway, but the new line further solidified the importance of the community in the regional lumber trade. The railway also facilitated the development of Fenelon Falls into an established grain terminal for the surrounding rural region as the railway allowed for bulk shipments of grain south to both Lindsay and the province's growing urban areas. Similarly, the community became a new gateway into the more unsettled areas of northeastern Victoria County and into Haliburton County as the primary rail linkage into Somerville Township and Haliburton.

Transport in and out of Fenelon Falls was further bolstered by the construction of the new lock and canal between 1882 and 1886. Since the development of a navigable waterway through the Kawartha throughout the mid-nineteenth century, Fenelon Falls had long been the upper terminus for navigation because of the falls. However, in 1882, the federal government agreed to open a new lock and canal to connect Sturgeon Lake with the upper lakes beyond. The new lock and canal were opened in 1886, further increasing access to and from Fenelon Falls.

By 1886, the population had reached its nineteenth and early twentieth century peak of just over 1,300 residents and the village was booming economically. This economic boom allowed for a period of substantial architectural growth in the community, particularly with regard to the downtown. Early images of Fenelon Falls show effectively a frontier community, with scatterings of wooden buildings, both residential and commercial marking out the village from the surrounding rural area. However, the growing prosperity throughout the 1860s, 1870s and 1880s allowed for substantial investment to be put into building stock and it was through this period that downtown Fenelon Falls and the commercial corridor along Colborne Street developed with new two and three storey brick buildings in the latest architectural styles housing shops and services for the growing community.

The subject property was a direct product of this economic growth and yields information about this period of development in Fenelon Falls' history. Its construction in the mid-1880s corresponds directly with the period of growth and consolidation in the community that saw a substantial number of new buildings constructed in brick, indicative of Fenelon Falls' late nineteenth century prosperity. The construction of new blocks such as this one was repeated throughout the commercial core of the village as new commercial blocks were erected throughout this time period, displaying the new wealth and stability of a community which had rapidly evolved from its early days as a lumber town to an incorporated Victorian village, with incorporation coming in 1875.

In particular, the property has important historical associations through its historic commercial uses. There are three commercial units in this block which have been used for a variety of purposes over time; however, there are two particular uses with specific historic value to the site and to downtown Fenelon Falls. The first is the longstanding use of 21 Colborne Street as a pharmacy, which began in 1888 and continues to the present day. The second is the former use of 23 and 25 Colborne Street as Burgoyne's Dry Goods, also known as William Burgoyne and Son, which was, in the early twentieth century, part of the largest grocery retail business in Fenelon Falls, run by father and son William and C.W. Burgoyne.

21 Colborne Street is one of the few commercial buildings in downtown Fenelon Falls that has maintained a continuous usage since it was constructed in the mid-1880s. In 1888, the storefront was rented to W.T. Junkin who opened a drug store in this location. Junkin, who appears to have operated the business personally for only a few years before selling his stock to H.J. Lytle in 1895, was also well known in the village as the long-standing village Clerk, Secretary of the School Board and lock master at the Fenelon Falls lock. Little is known about his business but, by the early twentieth century, had sold his business to Dr. David Gould, who had arrived in the community in 1898, where he practiced as both a doctor and druggist, until he retired in 1907. Dr. Gould was a well-respected member of the community, with his entry in the *Souvenir of Fenelon Falls* publication noting that he:

...conducts a well equipped drugstore opposite the Post Office, a complete stock of drugs, toilet articles, perfumes, stationery etc., is constantly on hand together with a splendid range of Webb's chocolates. He is also the local agent for the Bell Telephone Company, the Trent Valley Navigation Co., and the Toronto daily papers...Dr. Gould is the present chairman of the Water, Light and Power Commissioners and is one of the most level-headed businessmen in the village.²

After his retirement, Gould passed the business on to his son Alvin J. Gould, who had trained and a druggist and continued to operate the pharmacy until his untimely drowning in the Fenelon River in 1946. It was operated by the Gould family for the next seven years before its purchase in 1953 by Ken and Myrtle McArthur who operated it for the next 35 years and gave it the name it is known by in the present day: McArthur Drugs. After their retirement in 1984, it continued to operate as a pharmacy under different owners and continues to do so until this day.

Pharmacies were important businesses in nineteenth century, and later twentieth century, Fenelon Falls, although they became substantially more formalized as time progressed. Early pharmacies in nineteenth century Ontario were not formally regulated with the majority of drugs and cures dispensed made from a variety of mixtures of plant and animal substances; most pharmacies also sold other products to supplement their income, including various disparate items such as railway tickets, newspapers, and sweets. However, by the time Junkin opened his drug store in this location at the end of the 1880s, more stringent formalization of the profession through the Ontario College of Pharmacists, was occurring but still by no means universal; Junkin is listed on his marriage record in 1888 as a druggist but his actual

² *Souvenir of Fenelon Falls* (1904), 33.

training is unknown. However, by the turn of the century, the pharmacy profession was much more formalized and most pharmacies across the province were operated either by pharmacists or by doctors to provide medicines for both their own patients and others in the community. This was the case when the business was taken over by Dr. Gould, who was a trained physician, and his son Alvin Gould who had trained in pharmacy; the professionalization of the service continues to the present day as pharmacy operation developed throughout the twentieth century. However, the sideline business of the pharmacies in selling other goods has remained, from Dr. Gould acting as an agent for the Trent Valley Navigation Company selling steamship tickets to the longstanding practice of newspaper sales in drugs stores.

The building has been a pharmacy for 135 years and is likely Kawartha Lakes' oldest continuously operating pharmacy or drug store, and also likely one of the only remaining continuously operating nineteenth-century pharmacies in Ontario. Its functional continuity is rare, particularly amongst commercial buildings where changes of tenants from the nineteenth century to the present mean that a variety of businesses and uses have typically occupied the same space from the late Victorian period. Its continuous use supports its important historical associations as a local pharmacy and adds an additional layer of heritage value.

The other two units, 23 and 25 Colborne Street, hold historical value as Burgoyne's, a retail outlet, and at one time the largest in Fenelon Falls, which operated at this location from the late nineteenth century to 1965. It was an important retail establishment in Fenelon Falls from the late nineteenth century that originally sold groceries, as well as dry goods and other household goods, and a staple in the downtown for more than half of the twentieth century.

The origins of Burgoyne's are not definitively known. William Burgoyne first came to Fenelon Falls from Napanee around 1883 as the manager of the pulp mill but, by 1886, had entered into retail business with partner John R. Scott, although Scott would sell out his interests in the partnership by the early 1890s. Burgoyne's first store, operating under the name Burgoyne and Co., was known locally as the Red Store and initially began as a grocery store. By 1891, Burgoyne was expanding his establishment by cutting through the wall to the adjacent unit which was to hold dry goods, including fabric, clothing, china, and other manufactured products, in addition to the grocery business. In 1892, the Fenelon Falls Gazette referred to Burgoyne as Fenelon Falls' "leading retail

man”³ at a time when Burgoyne and Scott were parting ways. By 1904, the *Souvenir of Fenelon Falls* publication reports that Burgoyne:

...conducts the largest business of general description in Fenelon Falls and the stock...consists of general groceries in every possible line, crockery, boots and shoes and a complete stock of staple and fancy dry goods....Mr. Burgoyne employs six assistants and does a large business, both in town and throughout this and the surrounding counties. He makes a specialty of catering to the wants of the tourist trade.⁴

Burgoyne underwent a number of changes in business partners throughout the 1890s before his son, C.W. Burgoyne, formally joined the firm in 1902; in 1906, the firm changed its name to Burgoyne and Son and the official name of the retail store was W. Burgoyne and Son, a name that lasted until its closure in 1965. The younger Burgoyne had worked at the store since at least 1891 when, at the age of 19, he was listed in the census as a bookkeeper for the dry goods portion of the business. When his father died in 1927, he took over the business, but reduced it to a dry goods business only. The grocery portion was sold and the business reduced to a single storefront, at 23 Colborne Street where it continued to operate until 1965. Throughout the twentieth century, the dry goods store was known for carrying high quality goods, including fabrics, embroidery floss, doilies, handkerchiefs, boots, hats, china, and purses; at a time when many people still made their own clothing, a store where people could purchase good quality fabric and sewing supplies was an important fixture in any downtown and despite the focus on dry goods alone, Burgoyne’s remained one of Fenelon Falls’ most successful and well-known businesses. By the 1950s, the store had adapted to sell more ready-made clothing, but still kept many of its earlier offerings. C.W. Burgoyne continued to operate the store until his death in 1958, when it passed to his daughter Helena and her husband Garnet Graham, who operated it until its closure in 1965.

There are conflicting accounts of when Burgoyne’s opened in this location. There are reports that the store was moved to this location in 1910 under C.W. Burgoyne, but the fire insurance maps show the units as connected through an opening in the brick fire wall as early as 1898; stores joined in this fashion were rare in late nineteenth century Fenelon Falls, particularly because most of them were leased, and it is likely that this was the location of the store as early as the 1890s. The northern section at 25 Colborne Street was the grocery portion of the store, until the sale of the grocery business in 1928, when this side of the

³ “Retiring from Business,” *Fenelon Falls Gazette*, February 26, 1892, 5.

⁴ *Souvenir of Fenelon Falls* (1904), 31.

business was sold to long-time Burgoyne employee R.N. Mitchell who continued to operate it as a grocery store, but as a standalone business.

As a long standing commercial building in Fenelon Falls, 21-25 Colborne Street has historical and associative value in its role as part of the commercial development of downtown Fenelon Falls. It yields information regarding the spurt of commercial development in the community during the 1870s and 1880s, at the height of Fenelon Falls' nineteenth century prosperity, as part of a surge in commercial construction in the downtown. It also has specific historical associations with specific businesses in downtown Fenelon Falls, notably the continuing use of 21 Colborne Street as a pharmacy and with Burgoyne's Dry Goods which operated from 23 and 25 Colborne Street from the late nineteenth century to 1965 and was a fixture in the local community.

Contextual Value

21-25 Colborne Street has contextual value as a contributing feature to the historic commercial streetscape of downtown Fenelon Falls. The property, which is historically, visually and historically linked to its surroundings as part of the continuous commercial streetwall along the west side of Colborne Street, maintains and supports the historic commercial character of the village's downtown area which is characterized by its collection of Italianate commercial architecture dating primarily from the 1870s and 1880s. The downtown area includes a variety of late nineteenth century Italianate property executed in a similar style, size and massing to the subject property which, taken together, form a cohesive downtown landscape of which 21-25 Colborne Street is a contributing feature.

The majority of downtown Fenelon Falls, as it current exists, was developed in the closing decades of the nineteenth century. Increased prosperity during this period, as well as the 1884 fire which destroyed a number of buildings along the west side of Colborne Street, meant that new commercial buildings were erected quickly throughout the late 1870s and 1880s along Colborne Street which had grown throughout the nineteenth century into the commercial core of the community. Images of Colborne Street from the turn of the century show the commercial area of the community at its most complete historic iteration, with a continuous streetwall of two and three-storey brick buildings executed in the Italianate style along the west side of the street, older false façade commercial buildings along the east side along with a number of other Italianate structures near the intersection of Colborne Street and Francis Street.

Downtown Fenelon Falls has undergone a number of substantial changes since the turn of the twentieth century, but the majority of its Italianate commercial buildings along Colborne Street remain, although some have undergone significant modifications, notably McArthur House Hotel which is located on

the south end of this block and was cut from three storeys to two in the twentieth century. Taken together, these Italianate structures, including the subject property, form a cohesive grouping that defines the downtown area of Fenelon Falls as a historic commercial downtown. The majority have retained their size and massing, as well as many decorative elements, similar to the subject property and define the streetscape through their construction directly to the sidewalk and their adjacent properties which help to form a cohesive streetwall along Colborne Street.

The continuous historic streetwall that is characteristic of many historic Ontario downtowns, has, in particular, been maintained along the block where the subject property is located. The subject property is located on the west side of Colborne Street between Oak Street and Francis Street and is one commercial block along this section of street. The streetwall along this block is maintained for the entirety of the block, with the exception of the former post office constructed at the end of the block in 1935. The subject property is located within this streetwall, with between two other commercial structures. Through this continuous streetwall, the subject property remains physically linked to its surroundings, alongside its visual and historical links as part of the development of the late nineteenth century downtown streetscape.

Summary of Reasons for Designation

The short statement of reasons for designation and the description of the heritage attributes of the property, along with all other components of the Heritage Designation Brief, constitute the Reasons for Designation required under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Short Statement of Reasons for Designation

Design and Physical Value

21-25 Colborne Street has design and physical value as a representative example of Italianate commercial architecture in Fenelon Falls. The building, which was constructed between 1884 and 1888 as a replacement for an older commercial block, demonstrates the key features of this architectural style which was the most popular architecture style for commercial construction in Ontario in the second half of the nineteenth century. It is representative of the execution of this style in Fenelon Falls between about 1870 and 1890 when it was at its height of popularity and the commercial core of the village was developing rapidly from its pioneer beginnings to an established Victorian community.

Historical and Associative Value

21-25 Colborne Street has historical and associative value in its historic relationship to the development of downtown Fenelon Falls throughout the 1870s and 1880s. Throughout this period, the community underwent a period of rapidly increasing prosperity that attracted new businesses, residents and investment into the community. This property is a subject of that period of prosperity and yields information regarding Fenelon Falls' economic growth near the end of the nineteenth century. The property has direct and specific associations with a number of prominent late nineteenth and early twentieth century businesses that occupied its different units, specifically the longstanding and continuing use of 21 Colborne Street as a pharmacy and the former use of both 23 and 25 Colborne Street as Burgoyne's Dry Goods Store.

Contextual Value

21-25 Colborne Street has contextual value as a contributing feature to the historic commercial streetscape of downtown Fenelon Falls. The property, which is historically, visually and historically linked to its surroundings as part of the continuous commercial streetwall along the west side of Colborne Street, maintains and supports the historic commercial character of the village's downtown area which is characterized by its collection of Italianate commercial architecture dating primarily from the 1870s and 1880s. The downtown area includes a variety of late nineteenth century Italianate property executed in a similar style, size and massing to the subject property which, taken together, form a cohesive downtown landscape of which 21-25 Colborne Street is a contributing feature.

Summary of Heritage Attributes to be Designated

The Reasons for Designation include the following heritage attributes and apply to all elevations, unless otherwise specified, and the roof including: all façades, entrances, windows, chimneys, and trim, together with construction materials of wood, brick, stone, stucco, concrete, plaster parging, metal, glazing, their related building techniques and landscape features.

Design and Physical Attributes

The design and physical attributes support the value of the property as representative example of a late nineteenth century Italianate commercial block in downtown Fenelon Falls.

- Two storey stone and brick construction
- Brick front elevation
- Flat roof
- Ground floor storefronts including:
 - Recessed Victorian storefronts at 21 and 23 Colborne Street
- Division of front elevation into bays
- Pilasters
- Fenestration including:
 - Sash windows
 - Picture storefront windows
- Decorative brickwork including:
 - Decorative cornice
 - Dog tooth coursing

Historical and Associative Attributes

The historical and associative attributes support the value of the property in its association with the late nineteenth century development of Fenelon Falls and the longstanding use of the retail units.

- Association with the late nineteenth century development of Fenelon Falls
- Continuous use of 21 Colborne Street as a pharmacy
- Association with William Burgoyne and Son Dry Goods Store

Contextual Attributes

The contextual attributes support the value of the property as a contributing feature to the historic downtown commercial streetscape of Colborne Street.

- Orientation towards Colborne Street
- Construction to the lot line on the front and side elevations
- Continuous streetwall along Colborne Street
- Views of the property down Colborne Street

- Views of Colborne Street from the property

Images



Downtown Fenelon Falls, c. 1940



West side of Colborne Street, c. 1910



23 Colborne Street, c. 1958



23 Colborne Street interior, n.d.







Bibliography

Blumenson, John. *Ontario Architecture: A Guide to Styles and Building Terms, 1784 to the Present*. Toronto: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1990.

Brown, Ron. *Ghost Railways of Ontario*. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1994.

Canadian Post. Lindsay, 1857-1899.

Fenelon Falls Gazette. Fenelon Falls, 1873-2004.

Fenelon Falls Then and Now. 20th Anniversary Edition. 2020.

Forkey, Neil. *Shaping the Upper Canadian Frontier: Environment, Society and Culture in the Trent Valley*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2003.

Francois, Richard V. *Main Street Revisited: Time, Space, and Image Building in Small Town America*. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 1996.

Fuller's Counties of Peterborough and Victoria Directory for 1865 and 1866. Toronto: Blackburn's City Steam Press, 1866.

Gowans, Alan. *Styles and Types of North American Architecture: Social Function and Cultural Expression*. New York: Harper Collins, 1992.

Kalman, Harold. *A History of Canadian Architecture*. 2 vols. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1994.

Kirkconnell, Watson. *County of Victoria: Centennial History*. 2nd edition. Lindsay: County of Victoria Council, 1967.

Longstreth, Richard. *The Buildings of Main Street; A Guide to American Commercial Architecture*. Walnut Cree CA: AltaMira Press, 2000.

Lower, A.R.M. *The North American Assault on the Canadian Forest: A History of the Lumber Trade Between Canada and the United States*. Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1938.

Province of Ontario Gazetteer and Directory. 1869. Toronto: Robertson and Cook, 1869.

Sheumaker, Helen and Shirley Teresa Wajda. *Material Culture in America: Understanding Everyday Life*. Santa Barbara: ABC-Clio, 2008.

Steib, Ernst W. "A Professional Keeping Shop: The Nineteenth Century Apothecary." *Material Culture Review* 22 (1985): 1-10.

Walker, Glenn. "The Changing Face of the Kawarthas: Land Use and Environment in Nineteenth Century Ontario." PhD Thesis, McGill University. 2012.