

4 May Street, Fenelon Falls (McArthur Livery Stable)

Heritage Designation Evaluation

Fenelon Falls

PT LT 2-3 PL 51; PT LT 4 W/S COLBORNE ST, 5 W/S COLBORNE ST PL 17

FENELON PT 1 57R8290, T/W R378796, R411859

2023



Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The subject property has been researched and evaluated in order to determine its cultural heritage significance under Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act R.S.O. 1990. A property is eligible for designation if it has physical, historical, associative or contextual value and meets any two of the nine criteria set out under Regulation 9/06 of the Act. A heritage evaluation of the property has determined that 4 May Street has cultural heritage value or interest and merits designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:

i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method:

4 May Street is a unique example of a stone livery stable in Fenelon Falls. Constructed in 1883 as a livery stable for the adjacent McArthur House Hotel, it was constructed in stone from the recent construction of the lock and canal through Fenelon Falls and is a rare example of a livery stable constructed in this material when most were constructed in either wood or brick. However, it is also representative of the utilitarian structures erected for livery stables during this period.

ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit:

The property displays a typical degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit for a property of this type and age.

iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement:

There are no specific technical or scientific achievements associated with this property.

2. The property has historical or associative value because it:

i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to the community:

The property has direct historical associations with the late nineteenth century development of Fenelon Falls which reached the height of its nineteenth century prosperity in the 1870s and 1880s, around when this property was constructed. The property forms a key part of that development which was marked by increased commercial building stock and expansion of existing businesses in Fenelon Falls. It also has direct historical associations with local businessman and politician Joseph McArthur, its original owner, who was a prominent member of Fenelon Falls' late nineteenth century business community and is widely regarded as a major player in the development of the village during this time.

ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture:

The property yields information regarding the role of livery stables in nineteenth century communities and their key role in the development of transport during this period in its former role as a livery stable. It speaks to the importance of horses as a central mode of transport and labour in late nineteenth century Fenelon Falls, and Ontario more generally.

iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community:

The builder of this property is believed to have been local builder Edward Haw, who is believed to have worked on a large number of buildings in Fenelon Falls in the 1880s but about whom very little is known.

3. The property has contextual value because it:

i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area:

The property is important in maintaining the historic downtown commercial character of downtown Fenelon Falls as one of a large surviving collection of late nineteenth century commercial buildings in the community's commercial core.

ii. is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings:

The property is historically linked to its surroundings as part of the late nineteenth century development of downtown Fenelon Falls when a range of more permanent masonry buildings replaced older wooden structures throughout the downtown, a substantial portion of which are still extant.

iii. is a landmark.

The property is a local landmark as a highly unique and recognizable commercial building in downtown Fenelon Falls. Its prominent placement next to Lock 34 enhancing its value as a local landmark and well-known historic structure in the community.

Design and Physical Value

4 May Street has design and physical value as a unique example of a late nineteenth century livery stable in Fenelon Falls. Known as the McArthur Livery Stable, for its association with the adjacent McArthur House Hotel, the building was constructed as a utilitarian structure to house horses, tack, and carriages for the use of both locals and visitors to the community. Architecturally, the building is plain in its execution, but is unique in the community for its use of stone as the primary construction material where the majority of livery stables were typically constructed with wood or brick. It also appears to have been the largest of the community's late nineteenth century stables.

The livery stable developed in North America, both as a business and an architectural form, in the early nineteenth century as a space to house horses and horse-drawn vehicles. The centrality of horses in nineteenth century life demanded buildings and infrastructure to respond to their unique needs as working animals at the heart of many everyday activities. In particular, this included the need to house horses in stables. While some people, particularly the wealthy and those who lived in rural agricultural areas with room for outbuildings, and companies that owned large numbers of horses for their business operations housed their own horses in private stables and barns, and this was not the case for the majority of people who lived in towns and cities, where most people did not have the space or funds to maintain their own stable. By extension, many people did not have the financial capacity to own their own horses or vehicle at all and relied on letting them when horse transportation was required. As a result, the livery stable developed as a solution to this significant need, providing a space both for horse and vehicle owners to house their horses, and have those horses looked after by the stable's staff, and for those who did not have them to rent when the need required.

The stable originated as a utilitarian structural type, thousands of years prior to nineteenth century non-indigenous development in North America. The horse had long been an important aspect of transport and labour and buildings were erected to house them in geographic areas where horses were prevalent. Although their primary function remained consistent across time, geography and user – housing and caring for horses – their architectural form varied wildly. The most basic of these were stalls within existing agricultural buildings where horses were stabled alongside other animals and agricultural equipment; this form translated directly to the nineteenth century North American context, particularly in agricultural areas where horses were kept alongside other livestock for their usefulness in ploughing, planting and harvesting, as well as for transportation. At the other end of the spectrum, vast and elaborate private stables were erected by wealthy horse owners to house their herds of horses, tack, vehicles and, often, the staff who cared for them.

By the turn of the nineteenth century, private stables on British country estates were a common occurrence and were erected in the most up-to-date architectural style to display the taste and wealth of the owners; private stables of this type, although smaller, were also erected in urban settings to house horses for use in the city. Despite the vast breadth of size, type and style, however, most stables contained the same basic features to respond to horse welfare and comfort. These included individual stalls for horses, usually with a small window on the exterior wall for air circulation, a room or rooms for tack and other equipment, a grain room, a hay loft above, a storage area for vehicles – which was often a separate, but attached structure to the main stable itself – and a large area for tacking up, moving horses and vehicles, and general work around the stables. Most stables also included an open yard, which may have been an informal outdoor area in rural agricultural settings, or a more formalized courtyard in more complex stable developments.

With the arrival of non-indigenous settlers in North America, the stable was translated from the European context to the North American context quickly as it was a necessary part of the built infrastructure of day to day living. Early stables were primarily integrated into larger agricultural buildings with stable stalls integrated into barns in agricultural areas. Freestanding stables did not become particularly common in agricultural areas until around the 1860s when workhorses took over the major farm task of ploughing from oxen; an increased focus on breeding stock for North America resulted in more useful types of workhorses being developed around the middle of the nineteenth century. Freestanding stables did exist in urban areas and were more common earlier in the century as there were no other livestock to house within these structures. Urban stables varied wildly, from private stables at people's homes where small numbers of horses were kept for private transportation, to much larger operations for businesses that relied on horsepower, particularly as the century developed and horses were increasingly relied upon in the industrial city.

The livery stables, in the North American context, emerged in the early nineteenth century in response to the growing need for horse stabling and care in establishing settler communities. Like their private counterparts and as utilitarian buildings, livery stables took on a variety of forms, from the very simple to the very ornate. They also ranged in substantially in size, due to a variety of factors, including the size and wealth of the community and the prevalence of horses as a transportation method; although horses were used everywhere in the second half of the nineteenth century, livery stables in western communities were invariably larger because of the centrality of ranching to local economies. However, these were commercial structures and responded to different needs within community life and were explicitly intended as more public spaces. Often their architecture was reflective of this

commercial function, with signage and architectural features more typical of commercial buildings at the time. At their most basic, livery stables were effectively barns, erected in wood with few decorative features, although many included the use of gambrel roofs, a common feature in agricultural buildings, to set them apart from other vernacular buildings at this time. Some included false facades to lend an aura of size, permanence and commercial character to disguise the structure behind, which was often frame and box-like, with few decorative architectural features. However, as the century progressed, some livery stables, particularly in large urban areas, became increasingly ornate, incorporating stylistic features from the latest architectural styles, often the Italianate style which was prevalent in commercial architecture at this time. The use of popular architectural forms and decorative features was particularly used on the street facing façade of the structure to project a sense of prosperity and permanence, just as it was in other commercial buildings at this time. Brick also became increasingly common throughout the second half of the nineteenth century as a construction material for these buildings, as prosperity increased and brick became more readily available. However, livery stables remained a highly varied architectural type with no one common and consistent form or style.

All livery stables, however, included a number of key features necessary for their function. The majority were one-and-a-half to two storeys to accommodate an upper storey hay loft. They also all included oversized doors to admit carriages and horses. A large workspace was generally located in the centre of the building with stalls on either side, a grain room, and an opening to access the hayloft. Small windows allowed for air circulation, often with a small window located on the exterior wall of each stall. There was also generally an exterior access to the hayloft, often above the oversized main doors. As with most stables, vehicles were housed in a separate but attached structure accessed either from the stable itself or from the yard, a key feature of any livery stable. Although stables themselves could range in size, the yard, or corral, was usually quite large, and it was not unusual for stables, including their buildings and exterior space to take up an entire block. Most livery stables also included signage and advertising to advertise the fact that these stables were a business, as opposed to a private affair.

The subject property, located at 4 May Street, was developed in this context and fits well into wider trends in livery stable architecture in the second half of the nineteenth century. The building was constructed in 1883 as a livery stable for the adjacent McArthur House Hotel, located at the corner of Colborne and Water Streets; the construction of livery stables to serve hotels, as well as the surrounding community, was very common during this period when livery stables at hotels served to provide accommodation for guests' horses and vehicles, as well as to rent them out to guests and travellers who arrived by

train or steamship, as many did in Fenelon Falls in the late nineteenth century. It was constructed using limestone from the adjacent Lock 34 and canal which were under construction from 1882 to 1886, producing a substantial amount of material that local builders could take advantage of. The new stable was erected to the rear of the hotel along the northern edge of Water Street, with its side facing the new lock, and the front façade facing onto May Street.

The construction of the new stables was reported on in the July 21, 1883 edition of the *Fenelon Falls Gazette*. The newspaper reported that Joseph McArthur, the owner of the property:

...is not only putting up a stone stable, 40x100 feet and 18 feet high, but is inclosing over half an acre behind the hotel with a stone wall two feet thick and eight feet high, and when that is finished, will put up new sheds in place of the old ones and cover the most used portions of the yard with a thick layer of broken stone. The stable alone, which looks as if it will stand a thousand years, will cost at least \$1,400.¹

The sheds, which were intended for vehicles, were completed the following year along the May Street side of the property, extending behind both the hotel and the commercial block along Colborne Street next door to the hotel that McArthur also owned and the stone wall completed a commodious yard for the use of the vehicles and horses.

The property has been modified since its original construction in the late nineteenth century but retains its overall shape and massing; the sheds and stone wall have been removed so the only built element of the livery stable and yard complex that remains is the stone stable building itself. The interior has also been extensively changed as the building has undergone a number of changes since it ceased operating as a stable in the early twentieth century and has been used as a blacksmith's shop, retail establishment and brewery; the interior elements, such as horse stalls, have been removed. The building is constructed on a rectangular plan with a gable roof, as it was when it was constructed; the front wall dormer on the southern side of the building facing the canal is a newer addition. This wall included small windows along the row of stalls on the inside of the structure; these have been primarily enlarged and modified. On the gable ends of the building, oversized doors allowed entrance into the stables, with a hay door above for access to the hay loft; these have been retained although the doors themselves have been modified. Chimneys on the roof of the building marked where the stoves were located on the interior, to keep both horses and the men who worked there warm; these have also been removed.

¹ "New Buildings," *Fenelon Falls Gazette* July 21, 1883: 2.

When examined in relation to other livery stables constructed in Fenelon Falls, and Kawartha Lakes more generally during this period, the subject property is consistent with the wider trends and forms that were popular in the area, although its use of stone as a construction material is unique and a product of the time it was constructed at the same time as the Fenelon Falls Lock and its proximity to the canal where its construction material came from. At least three livery stables were extant in Fenelon Falls at the end of the nineteenth century, although as architectural forms that were both vernacular and had a tendency to move around in communities, this is likely not the full scope of nineteenth century livery in the village. The subject property was, however, the largest of these establishments. One of these former livery stables, also converted to commercial use, remains extant and is in close proximity to the subject property, at 12 Francis Street West. This livery stable was constructed around 1880 and is more typical of the design and material used in livery stable construction during this period. Constructed in wood, this building features a gambrel roof and appears more barn-like than the May Street building, although the wide discrepancies in the stylistic execution of livery stables mean that most were unique and relatively unrelated stylistically to one another. This building is, however, more typical in relation to its use of material where more buildings of this type were erected in wood than in stone.

This pattern holds true in other livery stables erected throughout Kawartha Lakes which are diverse in their execution, but generally were built in wood or brick. Two extant brick examples in Lindsay, located on York Street South and Cambridge Street South demonstrate the common forms found locally, with simple structures, gambrel roofs and brick construction, although the latter has since been rendered in stucco. These structures are plain in their execution and decorative details and set apart from the surrounding Italianate commercial buildings through their form, massing and style. Others, many of which have been demolished, had substantially plainer forms and were erected in wood, including one in Woodville which was a plain rectangular structure with a hipped roof and few other features.

Taking its context into consideration, 4 May Street is representative of the development of livery stables in nineteenth century North America as a utilitarian space for horse boarding and care, but it nevertheless unique within the Kawartha Lakes context because of its construction and material, and is the largest of Fenelon Falls' nineteenth century stables. Like other livery stables constructed throughout Kawartha Lakes in the late nineteenth century, the property is functional in its design and aesthetic and reflects the substantial need for accommodation for horses in communities during this period.

Historical and Associative Value

4 May Street has historical and associative value as a late nineteenth century livery stable serving the community of Fenelon Falls. Livery stables were an integral aspect of the nineteenth century urban environment and the erection of the subject property, known as the McArthur Livery Stables, in the community in 1883 yields information regarding their important role in the history of transportation in Victorian communities. Similarly, the property has direct historical associations with the late nineteenth century development of Fenelon Falls which reached the height of its nineteenth century prosperity in the 1870s and 1880s, around when this property was constructed. The property forms a key part of that development which was marked by increased commercial building stock and expansion of existing businesses in Fenelon Falls. It also has direct historical associations with local businessman and politician Joseph McArthur, its original owner, who was a prominent member of Fenelon Falls' late nineteenth century business community and is widely regarded as a major player in the development of the village during this time.

Fenelon Falls developed at the juncture of Cameron and Sturgeon Lakes along the short section of water now known as the Fenelon River. Prior to settlement, water flowed out of Cameron Lake over an approximately 7-metre-high falls through a rocky gorge before entering into Sturgeon Lake just under a kilometre away. The drop and current at this site made it an ideal location for a mill site and, in 1841, a grist mill was constructed on the future site of the community by early settlers James Wallis and Robert Jamieson whose land grants, made in the early 1830s, had included large portions of the current village site.

Wallis and Jamieson were the primary business drivers and community developers in what would eventually become Fenelon Falls throughout the 1840s, building store, taverns, and the new Church of England, as well as severing lots for building. The first bridge was built across the river around this time and corduroy roads gradually built to hamlets and rural settlements in the surrounding area

By 1851, the mill was demolished and replaced with separate grist and saw mills; it was also at this time that the first steamers arrived in Fenelon Falls, with the arrival of the Woodman out of Port Perry in 1851 on her maiden voyage. By this time, the lumber industry was rapidly developing in Kawartha Lakes and Fenelon Falls was well situated to take advantage of its economic benefits, with a prime location on the Fenelon River for transporting timber and mills for processing. New residents and businesses arrived and the community grew steadily throughout the 1850s and 1860s, with its population reaching about 300 people by 1865, and by the early 1870s, three large lumber mills operated in the village, processing millions of feet of pine annually.

The 1870s brought a major change for the community: the arrival of the railway. The Victoria Railway was chartered in 1872 with the intention of joining Lindsay by rail to the northern townships, Haliburton County, and, eventually, the projected Canadian Pacific Railway near Mattawa. Despite early political and financial hurdles, the line began construction in Lindsay in 1874 and soon reached Fenelon Falls. Over the next several years, construction continued north before the line ended at the final terminus in Haliburton village.

As in communities across Ontario, the arrival of the railway was a major economic boon for the community and struck off a period of rapid growth in Fenelon Falls. Not only did the railway make access easier to the community from the wider region, it also allowed for products to be transported in and out of the village and bolstered Fenelon Falls' growing industrial base, particularly with regard to dressed lumber which was overtaking squared timber, usually transported by water, as the preferred wood product and required transport by rail. Fenelon Falls was undoubtedly a lumber town prior to the arrival of the railway, but the new line further solidified the importance of the community in the regional lumber trade. The railway also facilitated the development of Fenelon Falls into an established grain terminal for the surrounding rural region as the railway allowed for bulk shipments of grain south to both Lindsay and the province's growing urban areas. Similarly, the community became a new gateway into the more unsettled areas of northeastern Victoria County and into Haliburton County as the primary rail linkage into Somerville Township and Haliburton.

Transport in and out of Fenelon Falls was further bolstered by the construction of the new lock and canal between 1882 and 1886. Since the development of a navigable waterway through the Kawartha throughout the mid-nineteenth century, Fenelon Falls had long been the upper terminus for navigation because of the falls; large sections of the waterway below the community were served by steamships beginning in the mid-nineteenth century, but there was no navigation beyond the community. However, in 1882, the federal government agreed to open a new lock and canal to connect Sturgeon Lake with the upper lakes beyond. The new lock and canal were opened in 1886, further increasing access to and from Fenelon Falls.

By 1886, the population had reached its nineteenth and early twentieth century peak of just over 1,300 residents and the village was booming economically. This economic boom allowed for a period of substantial architectural growth in the community, particularly with regard to the downtown. Early images of Fenelon Falls show effectively a frontier community, with scatterings of wooden buildings, both residential and commercial marking out the village from the surrounding rural area. However, the growing prosperity throughout the 1860s, 1870s and 1880s allowed for substantial investment to be put into building stock and it was through this period that downtown Fenelon Falls and

the commercial corridor along Colborne Street developed with new two and three storey brick buildings in the latest architectural styles housing shops and services for the growing community.

It was in this context that the subject property was developed. Constructed in 1883, it was built as a livery stable for the adjacent McArthur House Hotel. The hotel, owned by local businessman and politician Joseph McArthur, opened in 1874 to replace an older hotel, the Quebec and Ottawa Hotel, on the same location which had burned down earlier that year. The hotel, which catered to both commercial travellers and tourists, was one of several hotels which opened in the community during this period, responding to the growing mobility of local and regional residents, spurred, in large part, by the arrival of the railway as well as the expansion of the steamship network through the wider Kawartha region. The hotel itself, which survives in part at the corner of Colborne and Water Streets, was a marker of the prosperity of the community in the last quarter of the nineteenth century, boasting three-storeys with elaborate Italianate architecture and a well-fitted interior. The hotel was well-regarded as a premier accommodation with rooms for seventy guests alongside ample parlours, sample rooms and a large dining room. Although he owned the hotel alongside several other properties in downtown Fenelon Falls, McArthur did not operate the hotel, rather leasing the business out to others. When the stables were constructed, the lease was held by Nobel Ingram, a well respected local hotel proprietor who had earlier been the proprietor of the Dominion Hotel and the Mansion House Hotel, before taking over the lease of the McArthur House Hotel in 1882.

Upon taking over the lease, Ingram quickly set about making improvements to the hotel, including the addition of a billiards room to the hotel and the retrofitting of its room and parlours. However, the biggest renovations were undertaken on the exterior of the building, including removing the entrance to the yard from the Colborne Street side of the building and erected a new stone stable at the corner of May and Water Streets – the subject property – in 1883 using stone from the ongoing canal excavation, just a stone's throw away from the hotel property. The builder of the stable is believed to have been local builder Edward Haw who is known to have constructed a number of structures in downtown Fenelon Falls during this period; however, very little about his work or business is definitively known. A new wooden driveshed for vehicles and stone wall was added the following year along the May Street side of the property to create an enclosed interior yard. These changes expanded the services offered by the hotel, from accommodation for people to accommodation for their horses and vehicles as well.

The erection of a livery stable at a popular local hotel was reflective of the pressing need for accommodations for horses in nineteenth century life; although often overlooked, livery stables were extremely important structures

at this time because of the widespread use of horses in everyday activities. There were at least three livery stables in Fenelon Falls at the end of the nineteenth century that can be seen on the 1898 Fire Insurance map of the community, although the subject property is the largest. Horses were indispensable in nineteenth century communities and undertook huge amounts of labour in making human activity possible during this period. They were central aspects of every day life and could be seen everywhere from recreational travel to large worksites. Their presence had a substantial impact on the built environment with roads and streets built to accommodate horses and horse drawn vehicles and stables built to house them.

The late nineteenth century was undoubtedly the era of the horse. From the early nineteenth century, the population of horses in North America exploded as they were increasingly used for a large number of jobs in growing communities, both urban and rural. While the majority of horses lived in rural areas and rural people had a greater reliance on them for work and transport, by the second half of the nineteenth century, the urban horse population grew exponentially as they increasingly powered industrializing towns and cities and facilitated economic growth.

Horses were primarily viewed at time as useful machines facilitating human activity and took on a wide range of jobs in both urban and rural settings. The most well-known job was with regard to transport; outside of trains and boats, horses were the primary means of transport for most people in the nineteenth century. Although people did ride horses, they were primarily used for pulling vehicles, such as wagons, carriages and sleighs, where people and their possessions would ride. In urban areas, they were also used for mass transit, with horses pulling omnibuses and streetcars in the period before combustion engines and the electrification of streetcars.

However, horses main use was as work animals. On farms, they were used for nearly every aspect of crop development, from ploughing to planting to harvesting, with a range of machinery to facilitate various activities. In more urban environments, they were used to transport goods and freight, move materials to construction sites, extract rocks and trees, and power manufacturers in areas where other sources of power, such as water power, were not available, among other things. For much of the nineteenth century, horses were, in fact, seen as a more reliable power source than mechanized power, such as steam power, when these technologies were still very much in the early stages of their development while horses were a well-established and dependable source of power.

Of particular interest is the relationship between the expansion of the railway system and human reliance on horses. Contrary to the natural conclusion that the expansion of steam power would reduce the need for power provided by

horses, the use of horses actually increased with the growth of the railway network across both Ontario and North America more generally. Railways facilitated the mass movement of passengers and goods across communities, but were limited in their routes and stops. These passengers and goods, once they reached their railway stop, invariably needed onward transportation, requiring horses to move people to homes and hotels and goods to their next destinations, whether retail or manufacturing. In fact, horses usually featured on both sides of a railway journey, moving goods and people to the train and taking onward once they arrived. Similarly, the economic growth facilitated by the arrival of the railway further increased the need for horses with more goods being shipped in and out of communities and people having ever greater mobility across the province.

The impact of the horse on nineteenth century society was most evident in urban areas where thousands of horses drove the industrialization of North American cities throughout the second half of the nineteenth century, but it was also evident in Fenelon Falls. Unlike many urban communities, horses, by and large, were not used in manufacturing in Fenelon Falls as the village's natural power source – the Fenelon River – powered its primary manufacturers, mostly related to the lumber industry. They were, however, extensively used in other areas of day to day life and businesses in both the community and its rural hinterland throughout Fenelon, Verulam and Somerville Townships.

Horse power was integral to a number of commercial activities that formed the backbone of Fenelon Falls' economy. In particular, the nineteenth century lumber industry relied heavily on horses although their primary work took place in the lumber camps, not in the community itself, where they were used to haul logs from the bush to lakes and rivers for transport. Horses were also used extensively in agriculture, on which the Fenelon Falls economy heavily relied, for field preparation, planting, harvesting and crop transportation as well as in construction where horses hauled loads and moved materials to facilitate the erection of buildings and infrastructure. The construction of the Fenelon Falls lock beginning in 1882, for example, was undertaken with a substantial amount of horse power, where horses were used to extract rock from the canal site and haul it away.

However, horses' main use in Fenelon Falls village itself was for transportation where any transport that could not be undertaken by foot was done via horse. Few people actually rode horses as a mode of everyday transport; most people used wagons and carriages to get around, or sleighs in the winter; one of the more notable known usages in Fenelon Falls during this period was the omnibus operated by the Mansion House Hotel which was drawn by a team of two horses and transported passengers within Fenelon Falls. Particularly in an area with a large surrounding rural area, horses provided a means to travel to

outlying hamlets and rural areas, particularly for community members who travelled frequently, such as doctors and travelling salesmen. At the same time, horses provided a key link between the railway and local businesses, transporting goods from the train for local stores to sell and products from local manufacturers for export out of the community by rail.

Given the substantial presence of horses in late nineteenth century life, it was necessary for them to have places to stay when not working, be fed and watered, and for the equipment they used to be stored. While large companies in urban areas with substantial numbers of horses and some usually wealthy individuals kept their own stables, the majority of people did not have the expertise, skill, space or money to keep their own stables, or, in most cases, own their own horses. As a result, the livery stable developed to accommodate both horses and a community's need for them.

Livery stables served a number of functions within Victorian communities. Most communities had at least one, if not more, of various sizes to serve the needs of local residents and visitors. At their most basic, they provided boarding services for horses owned by local residents and businesses; while horses were the primary means of transport for most people during this period, those who owned them and lived in urban areas and small communities often did not have private stabling for them and so took advantage of local boarding facilities. At the livery stables, horses were boarded but also fed and cared for by the facility's staff. By extension, livery stables also often provided a place for local people to store horse drawn vehicles, such as wagons, coaches, and sleighs which were integral aspects of everyday nineteenth century life and important modes of transport around local areas. At the same time, livery stables also provided a place for horses to be stables while they were in town for the day or overnight, before travelling back home; this was of particular importance for local farming communities who relied on horses to come into town and needed somewhere to keep them while conducting their business. For those who stabled their horses privately, livery stables often still had a role, in the selling of saddles and harnesses, as well as hay and grain.

However, in addition to boarding privately owned horses, most livery stables also let horses and vehicles to less well-to-do customers or to travellers who required transportation while they were in town. Given the cost of owning horses and their associated equipment, letting horses and vehicles was a substantial portion of a livery stable's business that catered to a real and consistent need in the community. In addition to catering to everyday needs, such as the supply of wagons and carriages along with the requisite teams, many livery stables also catered to special occasions such as weddings or funerals, supplying fancier carriages or hearses for rent. Notably, in relation to the subject property, livery stables were often constructed in conjunction with hotels to provide transportation services for the hotel's clients.

In relation to the subject property, little is known about its exact operations, its usual clientele or the balance between boarding and renting that made up its operations. The stone building was the stables itself; Ingram had built a separate driving shed for vehicles adjacent to the subject property. However, given its location and relationship to the McArthur House Hotel, it can be assumed that a core part of its business was catering to hotel guests most of whom would have arrived in Fenelon Falls by train or steamship and required transportation once they were in town. The clientele of the hotel itself was mixed. While certainly accommodating tourists, who were coming to Fenelon Falls in increasing numbers in the late nineteenth century as the concept of summering in Ontario's lake country was gathering momentum amongst city dwellers, it also catered to a large number of travelling businessmen, notably travelling salesmen, or commercial travellers as they were usually known at this time, who travelled throughout the province during this period, selling goods, mostly in wholesale to retail establishments; the hotel had several dedicated sample rooms specifically for salesmen to display their goods to buyers. While tourists certainly would have rented horses, travelling salesmen would have been the much larger clientele for this aspect of the stables as they would often rent horses and a wagon to travel with their goods to outlying communities not served by the train or steamship. It also stabled horses for travellers and farmers who arrived in the community by horse, as the 1904 booklet *Souvenir of Fenelon Falls* noted in its description of the McArthur House Hotel: "In addition to affording first-class accommodation for the tourist and commercial trade, it is supplied with a large and splendidly kept stone stables, which supply every convenience to travellers driving in or the farming community."² There is little question that the building was well-used as an integral aspect of the transportation system in, out and around the community.

In this capacity, the subject property fulfilled a key, but sometimes overlooked, role in Fenelon Falls' nineteenth century life. It is representative of a period of history when prosperity was at its height in Fenelon Falls and the community was growing, and, in that growth, needed more facilities for everyday activities, including stabling horses that were used on a day to day basis for a multitude of tasks. It yields information about this key aspect of every day life and the importance of the livery stable for nineteenth century communities.

In addition to its importance in relation to Fenelon Falls' late nineteenth century development and the role of livery stables in Victorian communities, the subject property has specific historical connections with prominent local politician and businessman Joseph McArthur. McArthur was the original owner of the building and hotel with which it was associated, hence the name of the hotel as the McArthur House Hotel. He was a key figure in the development of

² *Souvenir of Fenelon Falls* (1904), 35.

Fenelon Falls in the late nineteenth century and a prominent local individual with a substantial amount of significance to the community during his life and in retrospect.

McArthur died from hepatic tuberculosis in December 1892 at the age of 54 and, in his obituary in the *Canadian Post*, it was noted that:

A prominent citizen passed away last week in the person of Mr. Joseph McArthur at the age of 54 years. Mr. McArthur was for years a member of the county council and held many public positions. Much of the progress of the village is owing to Mr. McArthur's enterprise.³

Despite this clear recognition at the time of his passing of his important role in the development of the community, very little is known about his life, in relation to the records usually available about prominent politicians and businessmen in nineteenth century Ontario communities.

McArthur was born around 1839 in Ops Township to John McArthur, who came to Canada from Ireland at some point in the 1830s, and Sarah Sharp. At the age of 24, he married Sarah Hall in Lindsay and, by the end of the 1860s, had moved to Fenelon Falls where he was granted a tavern license in March of 1869 by the Fenelon Township Council. He is not listed in the 1865 Peterborough and Victoria County Directory so appears to have arrived in the village between 1866 and 1869. His tavern appears to have been the Quebec and Ottawa House Hotel which stood on the site where the McArthur House Hotel was later constructed and which burned down in 1874.

Throughout the early 1870s, McArthur gradually built his local business interests through the purchasing of properties and construction of new ventures; some of these he operated directly, while others it appears he leased out to others to run, including the hotel which, at the time the livery stables were constructed, were leased to Ingram Nobel as the proprietor. In many of his ventures, he worked with his brother Alexander in both formal and informal partnerships. By the time of his second marriage to Ellen Kerr of Fenelon Falls in 1872, McArthur was identified on the marriage record as a lumber merchant, hinting at his expanding business interests; between 1873 and 1874, he operated a shingle mill on the Fenelon River. By the 1880s, his interests had primarily turned to grain, as Fenelon Falls had become a major local grain depot at this time due to its rail connections which allowed for the shipment of grain in bulk. He entered into various partnerships with different local businessmen, including with William Webster with whom he built new grain storehouses near the rail line. He also appears to have had interests in various

³ "Fenelon Falls," *Canadian Post* December 16, 1892, 1.

other business ventures, such as his purchase of the Fenelon Falls Tannery in 1886.

Along with these businesses, McArthur was busy with the construction and leasing of commercial property. He gradually acquired most of the land on which the Quebec and Ottawa House Hotel was located and built rows of commercial buildings for lease next door, along with the McArthur House Hotel itself. He also dealt in industrial property. For example, he owned the property on Francis Street West where the sash and door factory operated between 1878 and 1880 and which he later leased to William McKeown who operated a furniture factory there. His growing stature in the business community can be seen in the 1881 census where his occupation is listed as a gentleman.

McArthur was also actively involved in local politics. He was first elected to the inaugural Fenelon Falls village council in 1875 and continued to serve on the council for many years. By the early 1882, he had been elected reeve and also served on the county council. He also appears to have been active in the local agricultural society, and was a mason.

McArthur's impact on the community was substantial. Not only did he help shape local policy and direction through his political life, he also made substantial investments in the business and industrial life of the community which helped build its local economy. McArthur appears to have been very much in the background in most of his business ventures. Most of his properties were operated by other people while he put his time and energy into purchasing properties, constructing buildings, and leasing them to various other businessmen, even selling land to the federal government to facilitate the construction of the locks in the community. His rise to fortune and prominence in the community was rapid, from his arrival in the 1860s to his purchasing and operating of commercial properties throughout the 1870s and 1880s before his early death in 1892.

Contextual Value

4 May Street has contextual value as a long-standing local landmark. Known locally as the McArthur Livery Stable, in recognition of its original use, the property is architecturally distinct and is located directly adjacent to Lock 34, making it a highly recognizable and locally significant structure. Similarly, it is historically and physically linked to its surroundings as part of a large wave of development in Fenelon Falls throughout the 1880s, which included the construction of the canal through the village and of the lock; the stone for the structure came from the construction of the canal. Similarly, it supports and maintains the historic small town character of downtown Fenelon Falls.

The subject property was constructed in 1883, at the same time as the adjacent Lock 34 and portion of the Trent-Severn Waterway connecting the

Fenelon River with Cameron Lake; this was the last section of canal to be constructed in Kawartha Lakes and created the final link for through navigation by water in the region. The building was, in fact, erected using material excavated from the canal, as the construction caused a substantial amount of surplus stone removed from the area through the excavation process which was readily used in buildings in Fenelon Falls constructed in the mid-1880s. The property has direct material associations with the adjacent canal, and National Historic Site, through its material, but also historical associations through their shared development history.

The property similarly is historically linked to its surroundings as part of the substantial commercial development of Fenelon Falls that occurred in the 1880s; in particular, the large fire that occurred on the west side of Colborne Street in 1884 – but did not impact the subject property – helped further an already occurring construction boom happening in the community during this period, that resulted not only in the erection of the subject property, but also the majority of the extant Victorian commercial buildings along Colborne Street. More specifically, it is directly historically linked to the adjacent buildings also owned by Joseph McArthur that formed part of the wider McArthur House Hotel complex, including 7 Colborne Street, the former McArthur House Hotel itself which has been substantially modified since the nineteenth century, and the adjacent McArthur Block at 13-19 Colborne Street, a commercial block owned by McArthur of which the top floor was used as extension to the hotel proper.

The property also supports the historic commercial character of downtown Fenelon Falls, as an extant commercial building from this period. The majority of the downtown, including the subject property, was constructed between approximately 1870 and 1890 and forms a cohesive commercial landscape including a range of building types and sizes along Colborne Street and its cross streets. Although most of the properties are constructed in the Italianate style and were originally retail or hospitality establishments, the subject property nevertheless contributes to this overall historic character as a unique historic structure related to the other buildings throughout the downtown.

The property is also a landmark in its own right. Located directly adjacent to Lock 34, the property is highly visible within the community to both tourists and residents in the community. It is a highly unique structure within the village that is not replicated elsewhere and its continued operation as a commercial structure mean that it is well known in the history of the community and well-recognized both locally and in the wider Kawartha Lakes region.

Summary of Reasons for Designation

The short statement of reasons for designation and the description of the heritage attributes of the property, along with all other components of the Heritage Designation Brief, constitute the Reasons for Designation required under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Short Statement of Reasons for Designation

Design and Physical Value

4 May Street has design and physical value as a unique example of a late nineteenth century livery stable in Fenelon Falls. Known as the McArthur Livery Stable, for its association with the adjacent McArthur House Hotel, the building was constructed as a utilitarian structure to house horses, tack, and carriages for the use of both locals and visitors to the community. Architecturally, the building is plain in its execution, but is unique in the community for its use of stone as the primary construction material where the majority of livery stables were typically constructed with wood or brick. It also appears to have been the largest of the community's late nineteenth century stables.

Historical and Associative Value

4 May Street has historical and associative value as a late nineteenth century livery stable serving the community of Fenelon Falls. Livery stables were an integral aspect of the nineteenth century urban environment and the erection of the subject property, known as the McArthur Livery Stables, in the community in 1883 yields information regarding their important role in the history of transportation in Victorian communities. Similarly, the property has direct historical associations with the late nineteenth century development of Fenelon Falls which reached the height of its nineteenth century prosperity in the 1870s and 1880s, around when this property was constructed. The property forms a key part of that development which was marked by increased commercial building stock and expansion of existing businesses in Fenelon Falls. It also has direct historical associations with local businessman and politician Joseph McArthur, its original owner, who was a prominent member of Fenelon Falls' late nineteenth century business community and is widely regarded as a major player in the development of the village during this time.

Contextual Value

4 May Street has contextual value as a long-standing local landmark. Known locally as the McArthur Livery Stable, in recognition of its original use, the property is architecturally distinct and is located directly adjacent to Lock 34, making it a highly recognizable and locally significant structure. Similarly, it is historically and physically linked to its surroundings as part of a large wave of development in Fenelon Falls throughout the 1880s, which included the construction of the canal through the village and of the lock; the stone for the

structure came from the construction of the canal. Similarly, it supports and maintains the historic small town character of downtown Fenelon Falls.

Summary of Heritage Attributes to be Designated

The Reasons for Designation include the following heritage attributes and apply to all elevations, unless otherwise specified, and the roof including: all façades, entrances, windows, chimneys, and trim, together with construction materials of wood, brick, stone, stucco, concrete, plaster parging, metal, glazing, their related building techniques and landscape features.

Design and Physical Attributes

The design and physical attributes of the property support its value as a unique example of a late nineteenth century livery stable in Fenelon Falls.

- One-and-a-half storey rubble limestone construction
- Rectangular plan
- Gable roof
- Fenestration
- Oversized stable doorway
- Hay door including radiating voussoir

Historical and Associative Attributes

The historical and associative attributes of the property support its value in providing information regarding the development of Fenelon Falls in the 1880s, the role of livery stables in nineteenth century life, and local businessman Joseph McArthur.

- Historic use as a livery stable
- Location adjacent to the former McArthur House Hotel and McArthur Block
- Historical association with Joseph McArthur

Contextual Attributes

The contextual attributes of the property support its value as a local landmark and its relationship to Lock 34 as well as in its role as a contributing feature to the historic commercial landscape of downtown Fenelon Falls.

- Location at the intersection of May Street and Water Streets
- Location along the north side of the Trent Severn Waterway
- Proximity to Lock 34
- Views of the property from Oak Street, Water Street, May Street, Lock 34, the Trent Severn Waterway and the Colborne Street bridge

- View from the property to the surrounding commercial landscape, Water Street, Oak Street and the Trent Severn Waterway, including Lock 34

Images



View of downtown Fenelon Falls, n.d.



View of the stable from the canal, n.d.



Stables, c. 1977







Select Bibliography

- Angus, James T. *A Respectable Ditch: A History of the Trent Severn Waterway, 1833-1920*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1988.
- Blumenson, John. *Ontario Architecture: A Guide to Styles and Building Terms, 1784 to the Present*. Toronto: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1990.
- Canadian Post*. Lindsay, 1857-1899.
- Fenelon Falls Gazette*. Fenelon Falls, 1873-2004.
- Fenelon Falls Then and Now*. 20th Anniversary Edition. 2020.
- Greene, Ann Norton. *Horses at Work: Harnessing Power in Industrial America*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 2008.
- Kheraj, Sean. "Urban Environments and the Animal Nuisance: Domestic Livestock Regulation in Nineteenth Century Canadian Cities." *Urban History Review* 44, no. 1-2 (2015): 37-55.
- Kirkconnell, Watson. *County of Victoria: Centennial History*. 2nd edition. Lindsay: County of Victoria Council, 1967.
- Jasen, Patricia. *Wild Things: Nature, Culture and Tourism in Ontario, 1790-1914*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995.
- Longstreth, Richard. *The Buildings of Main Street; A Guide to American Commercial Architecture*. Walnut Cree CA: AltaMira Press, 2000.
- McShane, Clay and Joel Tarr. "The Centrality of the House in the Nineteenth-Century American City." In *The Making of Urban America*, edited by Raymond A. Mohl, 105-130. Lanham MD: SR Books, 1997.
- McShane, Clay and Joel Tarr. *The Horse in the City: Living Machines in the Nineteenth Century*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2007.
- Spence, Clark C. "The Livery Stable in the American West." *Montana: The Magazine of Western History* 36, no. 2 (1986): 36-49.
- Visser, Thomas Durant. *Field Guide to New England Barns and Farm Buildings*. Hanover NH: University Press of New England, 2012.