



Committee of the Whole Report

Report Number:	ED2023-055
Meeting Date:	November 7, 2023
Title:	Proposed Heritage Designation of 130-132 William Street North, Town of Lindsay (Carew Lumber Company Office)
Description:	Proposed heritage designation of 130-132 William Street North under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act
Author and Title:	Emily Turner, Economic Development Officer – Heritage Planning

Recommendations:

That Report ED2023-055, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 130-132 William Street North, Town of Lindsay (Carew Lumber Company Office)**, be received;

That the Municipal Heritage Committee's recommendation to designate 130-132 William Street North under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as being of cultural heritage value or interest be endorsed;

That staff be authorized to proceed with the process to designate the subject properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, including the preparation and circulation of Notices of Intention to Designate, and preparation of the designating by-laws; and

That this recommendation be brought forward to Council for consideration at the next Regular Council Meeting.

Department Head: _____

Financial/Legal/HR/Other: _____

Chief Administrative Officer: _____

Background:

The City of Kawartha Lakes designates properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Properties are recommended for designation by their owners, members of the public, local organizations, the Municipal Heritage Committee, Council or staff. Properties proposed for designation are reviewed by the Municipal Heritage Committee, as required by subsection 29(2) of the Ontario Heritage Act, and their recommendation is brought forward to Council under the cover of a staff report.

130-132 William Street North, also known as the Carew Lumber Company Office, was constructed in the early twentieth century prior to 1908 and is a historic Italianate commercial building in Lindsay. The property is currently listed on the City's Heritage Register. Although there was initially no intention by staff to designate this building under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act made through Bill 23, More Homes Built Faster Act (2022) now require municipalities to designate listed properties or remove them from the Register within two years of the amendments coming into effect. Practically, this means that, in order for municipalities to provide heritage protection to its cultural heritage resources as is required by provincial land use planning policy, they must be designated under Part IV of the Act. The amendments came into effect on January 1, 2023.

130-132 William Street North has been prioritized as an important small-town commercial building with significant historical associations through its longstanding role as the administrative office for the Carew Lumber Company. It has a high degree of architectural and historical value in Lindsay. This property was identified by the Municipal Heritage Committee and staff as a priority property. Staff have undertaken a site visit to and heritage evaluation report about the property and have determined that the property is eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act.

At its meeting of October 5, 2023, the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee reviewed the heritage evaluation report for this property and adopted the following resolution:

KLMHC2023-118

Moved By I. McKechnie

Seconded By W. Bateman

That Report KLMHC2023-068, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 130-132 William Street North, Town of Lindsay**, be received;

That the designation of the property known municipally as 130-132 William Street North be endorsed; and

That the recommendation to designate the subject property be forwarded to Council for approval.

Carried

This report addresses that direction.

Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act provides that, upon consultation with its municipal heritage committee, and after serving a Notice of Intention to Designate pursuant to the requirements of the Act, the Council of a municipality may pass a by-law designating a property within the boundaries of the municipality to be of cultural heritage value or interest if it fulfils the criteria for designation under the Act, as identified in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Both staff and the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee are satisfied that the subject property fulfils the criteria for designation set out under Ontario Regulation 9/06.

Rationale:

Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies the criteria for determining the cultural heritage value of a property. Under this regulation, a property may be designated under Part IV, s.29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets at least two of the following criteria:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
 - b. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
 - c. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
2. The property has historical value or associative value because it:
 - a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
 - b. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or

- c. demonstrates the work of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.
3. The property has contextual value because it:
- a. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area,
 - b. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
 - c. is a landmark.

Amendments made to the Ontario Heritage Act under Bill 23 require a property to meet two or more criteria in order to be eligible for designation. 130-132 William Street North fulfils multiple criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and is therefore eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act. A heritage evaluation report has been prepared for this property which outlines its significance and demonstrates which criteria it fulfils. This report is attached as Appendix A. A statement of significance for the property as required by the Act, which summarizes the property's cultural heritage value and reasons for designation, can be found below.

130-132 William Street North East Statement of Significance

Design and Physical Value

130-132 William Street North has cultural heritage value as a representative, but late, example of an Italianate commercial building in Lindsay. Originally constructed prior to 1908 as a one storey building and enlarged, likely in the early 1910s with a second storey, the building includes a range of features typical of a commercial building of this type which include its flat roof, ornate cornice brick work and pilasters. This architectural style was the most popular style for urban commercial architecture throughout the late nineteenth and early twentieth century and the subject property is a representative example of a detached structure of this type. It is also unique as a surviving industrial office building in Lindsay, at a time when most administrative offices integrated into larger industrial complexes and no longer survive with the departing of those industries from Lindsay throughout the twentieth century.

Historical and Associative Value

130-132 William Street North has historical and associative value as the former Carew Lumber Company Office. The building served as the administrative office for the Carew

Lumber Company during the early years of the twentieth century when the company was one of Lindsay's largest employers and a major economic driver. As its administrative office, the property has direct historical associations with this. The property yields information on the lumber industry in Kawartha Lakes around the turn of the twentieth century when it was the largest sector of the regional economy and a key factor in the economic development of the region. The majority of the company's complex, which once stood to the northeast of this site, is no longer extant and the subject property is the remaining built feature from this major industrial site. The site holds additional historical value in its direct historical association with John Carew and, more broadly, the Carew family on a personal level. In addition to his business activities, Carew served as the Member of Provincial Parliament for Victoria North and the family as a whole was a significant family in late nineteenth and early twentieth century Lindsay.

Contextual Value

130-132 William Street North has contextual value as a contributing feature to the historic landscape of William Street North which contains a range of late nineteenth and early twentieth century properties. The property is of a similar size, massing and age to its surroundings and contributes to the overall mature and developed character of the surrounding area. The property is historically linked to its surroundings as part of the turn of the century development of this area of Lindsay which includes a wide array of properties constructed in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The property is also linked historically and functionally to the nearby Scugog River which was integral for the operations of lumber company and the wider lumber processing landscape of late nineteenth and early twentieth century Lindsay.

Provincial Policy Conformity

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) sets the policy foundation for development and land use planning in Ontario. The policy intends to balance the needs of growth and economic development with the need for ensuring a high quality of life, public safety and health, and the conservation of natural and cultural heritage resources. Section 2.6 (Cultural Heritage and Archaeology) requires municipalities to conserve significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes as part of the land use

planning process, stating that “Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.”

Significant built heritage resources, as defined by the PPS, are those which have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest as established by the criteria under the Ontario Heritage Act. These criteria are outlined by Ontario Regulation 9/06. The subject property has been evaluated based on the criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and has been found to fulfil those criteria and, therefore, is a significant heritage resource within the municipality which requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act.

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2019)

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe was prepared by the Ontario government in order to help guide the land use planning process and assist communities within the Greater Golden Horseshoe achieve a high quality of life, positive economic development, and protection for important local resources.

Section 4.2.7 (Cultural Heritage Resources) requires municipalities to conserve their cultural heritage resources as part of the land use planning process “in order to foster a sense of place and benefit communities”. The Growth Plan defines cultural heritage resources as “built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes, and archaeological resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest for the important contribution that make to our understanding of the history of a place, event, or a people. While some cultural heritage resources may already be identified and inventoried by official sources, the significance of others can only be determined after evaluation.”

The subject property has been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest through evaluation based on Ontario Regulation 9/06 and therefore requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act. This property has a high degree of historic significance with regard to the history of Lindsay and the role of the lumber industry in the development of the community and community benefit would be gained through its ongoing preservation.

City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan (2012)

The City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan was amended in 2017 to include strengthened cultural heritage policies. Official Plan Amendment 26 outlined those amendments.

Three of the heritage policies speak directly to the conservation of individual heritage properties:

- a) Cultural heritage resources of significant cultural heritage value or interest shall be identified, protected and conserved.
- e) The City shall use the tools available to it under the Municipal Act, the Planning Act, the Environmental Assessment Act, and the Ontario Heritage Act to conserve cultural heritage resources.
- f) Cultural heritage resources shall be maintained in situ and in a manner that prevents the deterioration and conserved the identified cultural heritage values or interest and/or identified heritage attributes of the cultural heritage resource.

The City's policies require it to conserve cultural heritage resources and designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act is a tool for doing so. In this case, the subject property has been found to have cultural heritage value through evaluation and individual designation is the most appropriate method for ensuring its conservation.

Other Alternatives Considered:

There are no recommended alternatives. Amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act now require municipalities to review and designate their listed properties and the City is required to follow provincial direction.

Alignment to Strategic Priorities

The designation of property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act supports the following goals from the Council adopted Strategic Plan:

- A Vibrant and Growing Economy
- An Exceptional Quality of Life

The identification and protection of heritage assets in the community through designation promotes an exceptional quality of life by supporting and promoting arts, culture and heritage within the municipality. Designation provides long term protection and management for key heritage resources in the municipality and recognizes their importance to the community.

The protection of heritage resources in the municipality also assists in the growth of the local economy in general by identifying, protecting, and celebrating places where people want to live, work and visit. It encourages investment in local communities by ensuring and promoting attractive places for residents and businesses to be. It also has a direct impact on developing local tourism through the preservation of sites and landscapes that people want to visit.

Financial/Operation Impacts:

There will be costs associated with the provision of public notice and for the registration of the designation by-law associated with this application which are included in the 2023 Heritage Planning budget.

It is possible that there will be any additional legal fees if there is an owner-initiated appeal to the Ontario Land Tribunal as the property is privately owned. There is also the potential for third-party appeals of the designation to the Ontario Land Tribunal; however, appeals of this nature are rare.

Consultations:

Municipal Heritage Committee.

Statutory notices to owners under the Ontario Heritage Act are issued once Council has issued a resolution to issue a Notice of Intention to Designate under subsection 29(3) of the Act. The issuance of a Notice of Intention to Designate triggers the formal consultation process with the property owners and the general public.

Attachments:

Appendix A – Heritage Evaluation Report: 130-132 William Street North



Adobe Acrobat
Document

Department Head email: rholy@kawarthalakes.ca

Department Head: Richard Holy, Director of Development Services