



Committee of the Whole Report

Report Number:	ED2024-007
Meeting Date:	March 5, 2024
Title:	Proposed Heritage Designation of 317 Kent Street West, Town of Lindsay (Elmholme)
Description:	Proposed heritage designation of 317 Kent Street West under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act
Author and Title:	Emily Turner, Economic Development Officer – Heritage Planning

Recommendations:

That Report ED2024-007, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 317 Kent Street West, Town of Lindsay**, be received;

That the Municipal Heritage Committee’s recommendation to designate 317 Kent Street West under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as being of cultural heritage value or interest be endorsed;

That staff be authorized to proceed with the process to designate the subject property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, including the preparation and circulation of Notice of Intention to Designate, and preparation of the designating by-law; and

That this recommendation be brought forward to Council for consideration at the next Regular Council Meeting.

Department Head: _____

Financial/Legal/HR/Other: _____

Chief Administrative Officer: _____

Background:

The City of Kawartha Lakes designates properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Properties are recommended for designation by their owners, members of the public, local organizations, the Municipal Heritage Committee, Council or staff. Properties proposed for designation are reviewed by the Municipal Heritage Committee, as required by subsection 29(2) of the Ontario Heritage Act, and their recommendation is brought forward to Council under the cover of a staff report.

317 Kent Street West, also known as Elmholme, was constructed in the mid-1860s and is an important example of Victorian Gothic Revival residential architecture in Lindsay, although it is now commercially-zoned and used as a business. It has historic connections with several important Lindsay businesses from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The property is currently listed on the City's Heritage Register. Although there was initially no intention by staff to designate this building under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act made through Bill 23, More Homes Built Faster Act (2022) now require municipalities to designate listed properties or remove them from the Register within two years of the amendments coming into effect. Practically, this means that, in order for municipalities to provide heritage protection to its cultural heritage resources as is required by provincial land use planning policy, they must be designated under Part IV of the Act. The amendments came into effect on January 1, 2023.

317 Kent Street West has been prioritized as a landmark residential building in Lindsay with the potential for future development pressures due to the large size of the lot and its location in close proximity to the large commercial area on the west end of Kent Street West. It has a high degree of architectural and historical value in Lindsay. The designation of this property would provide controls for future development on the subject property itself as well as on adjacent properties and give Council and staff additional tools to ensure compatibility with the existing historic fabric of Lindsay when reviewing and approving new development. This property was identified by the Municipal Heritage Committee and staff as a priority property. Staff have undertaken a site visit to and heritage evaluation report about the property and have determined that the property is eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act.

At its meeting of February 1, 2024, the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee reviewed the heritage evaluation report for this property and adopted the following resolution:

KLMHC2024-016

Moved By I. McKechnie

Seconded By J. Hartman

That Report KLMHC2024-011, **Proposed Heritage Designation of 317 Kent Street West, Town of Lindsay (Elmholme)**, be received;

That the designation of the property known municipally as 317 Kent Street West be endorsed; and

That the recommendation to designate the subject property be forwarded to Council for approval.

Carried

This report addresses that direction.

Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act provides that, upon consultation with its municipal heritage committee, and after serving a Notice of Intention to Designate pursuant to the requirements of the Act, the Council of a municipality may pass a by-law designating a property within the boundaries of the municipality to be of cultural heritage value or interest if it fulfils the criteria for designation under the Act, as identified in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Both staff and the Kawartha Lakes Municipal Heritage Committee are satisfied that the subject property fulfils the criteria for designation set out under Ontario Regulation 9/06.

Rationale:

Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies the criteria for determining the cultural heritage value of a property. Under this regulation, a property may be designated under Part IV, s.29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets at least two of the following criteria:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
 - b. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or

- c. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
2. The property has historical value or associative value because it:
- a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
 - b. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
 - c. demonstrates the work of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.
3. The property has contextual value because it:
- a. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area,
 - b. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
 - c. is a landmark.

Amendments made to the Ontario Heritage Act under Bill 23 require a property to meet two or more criteria in order to be eligible for designation. 317 Kent Street West fulfils multiple criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and is therefore eligible for designation under Part IV of the Act. A heritage evaluation report has been prepared for this property which outlines its significance and demonstrates which criteria it fulfils. This report is attached as Appendix A. A statement of significance for the property as required by the Act, which summarizes the property's cultural heritage value and reasons for designation, can be found below.

317 Kent Street West Statement of Significance

Design and Physical Value

317 Kent Street West has design and physical value as a representative example of a Gothic Revival residential property in Kawartha Lakes. Constructed around the mid-1860s as a farmhouse in rural Ops Township, the property displays key characteristics of this domestic architectural style as executed in rural areas including its steeply pitched roofs, decorative bargeboards, polychromatic brickwork, stacked chimneys, rounded windows and wide verandah. It is one of the largest examples of this style of architecture within Lindsay and demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship through its extant decorative elements.

Historical and Associative Value

317 Kent Street West has historical and associative value through its associations with the Matthews family, specifically father and son George and Albert Matthews, the elder of which owned the property from 1876 to 1899. George Matthews was a local businessman who established a highly successful meat packing business in Lindsay in 1868 which would eventually grow into a national enterprise. Albert, one of his ten children, became Lieutenant-Governor of Ontario between 1937 and 1946, becoming the province's longest serving Lieutenant Governor. Both father and son were heavily involved in the Baptist Church and, through them, the property yields significant information regarding the growth and development of the Baptists in Lindsay and on a more national level. The property also has direct associations with the lumber industry in Lindsay through its subsequent owner, James Peel, the early twentieth century owner of the Gull River Lumber Company.

Contextual Value

317 Kent Street West has contextual value as a local landmark. Originally constructed as a farmhouse in rural Ops Township, the property has since been absorbed into the urban fabric of the west side of Lindsay and has lost much of its original context. However, it remains a very well-known and easily recognized structure in Lindsay for its distinctive architecture and prominent location at the southwest corner of the intersection of Kent Street West and Angeline Street South.

Provincial Policy Conformity

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) sets the policy foundation for development and land use planning in Ontario. The policy intends to balance the needs of growth and economic development with the need for ensuring a high quality of life, public safety and health, and the conservation of natural and cultural heritage resources. Section 2.6 (Cultural Heritage and Archaeology) requires municipalities to conserve significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes as part of the land use planning process, stating that "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved."

Significant built heritage resources, as defined by the PPS, are those which have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest as established by the criteria under the Ontario Heritage Act. These criteria are outlined by Ontario Regulation 9/06.

The subject property has been evaluated based on the criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and has been found to fulfil those criteria and, therefore, is a significant heritage resource within the municipality which requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act.

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2019)

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe was prepared by the Ontario government in order to help guide the land use planning process and assist communities within the Greater Golden Horseshoe to achieve a high quality of life, positive economic development, and protection for important local resources.

Section 4.2.7 (Cultural Heritage Resources) requires municipalities to conserve their cultural heritage resources as part of the land use planning process “in order to foster a sense of place and benefit communities”. The Growth Plan defines cultural heritage resources as “built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes, and archaeological resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest for the important contribution they make to our understanding of the history of a place, event, or a people. While some cultural heritage resources may already be identified and inventoried by official sources, the significance of others can only be determined after evaluation.”

The subject property has been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest through evaluation based on Ontario Regulation 9/06 and therefore requires conservation through designation under Part IV of the Act. This property has a high degree of architectural and historical significance in Lindsay and community benefit would be gained through its ongoing preservation.

City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan (2012)

The City of Kawartha Lakes Official Plan was amended in 2017 to include strengthened cultural heritage policies. Official Plan Amendment 26 outlined those amendments.

Three of the heritage policies speak directly to the conservation of individual heritage properties:

- a) Cultural heritage resources of significant cultural heritage value or interest shall be identified, protected and conserved.

- e) The City shall use the tools available to it under the Municipal Act, the Planning Act, the Environmental Assessment Act, and the Ontario Heritage Act to conserve cultural heritage resources.
- f) Cultural heritage resources shall be maintained in situ and in a manner that prevents deterioration and conserves the identified cultural heritage values or interest and/or identified heritage attributes of the cultural heritage resource.

The City's policies require it to conserve cultural heritage resources and designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act is a tool for doing so. In this case, the subject property has been found to have cultural heritage value through evaluation and individual designation is the most appropriate method for ensuring its conservation.

Other Alternatives Considered:

There are no recommended alternatives. Amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act now require municipalities to review and designate their listed properties and the City is required to follow provincial direction.

Alignment to Strategic Priorities

The designation of property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act supports the following goals from the Council adopted Strategic Plan:

- A Vibrant and Growing Economy
- An Exceptional Quality of Life

The identification and protection of heritage assets in the community through designation promotes an exceptional quality of life by supporting and promoting arts, culture and heritage within the municipality. Designation provides long term protection and management for key heritage resources in the municipality and recognizes their importance to the community.

The protection of heritage resources in the municipality also assists in the growth of the local economy in general by identifying, protecting, and celebrating places where people want to live, work and visit. It encourages investment in local communities by ensuring and promoting attractive places for residents and businesses to be. It also has a direct impact on developing local tourism through the preservation of sites and landscapes that people want to visit.

Financial/Operation Impacts:

There will be costs associated with the provision of public notice and for the registration of the designation by-law associated with this application which are included in the 2024 Heritage Planning budget.

It is possible that there will be additional legal fees if there is an owner-initiated appeal to the Ontario Land Tribunal as the property is privately owned. There is also the potential for third-party appeals of the designation to the Ontario Land Tribunal; however, appeals of this nature are rare.

Consultations:

Municipal Heritage Committee.

Statutory notices to owners under the Ontario Heritage Act are issued once Council has issued a resolution to issue a Notice of Intention to Designate under subsection 29(3) of the Act. The issuance of a Notice of Intention to Designate triggers the formal consultation process with the property owner(s) and the general public.

Attachments:

Appendix A – Heritage Evaluation Report: 317 Kent Street West



Adobe Acrobat
Document

Department Head email: lbarrie@kawarthalakes.ca

Department Head: Leah Barrie, Director of Development Services