



PLANNING  
URBAN DESIGN  
& LANDSCAPE  
ARCHITECTURE

September 20, 2023

Kent Randall  
EcoVue Consulting  
krandall@ecovueconsulting.com

Dear Mr. Randall,

**RE: 46-66 William Street North, Lindsay**

**OUR FILE 20359A**

MHBC was retained in 2020 to prepare a Heritage Impact Assessment for the proposed development of the lands addressed as 46-66 William Street North, Lindsay. At the time, the development concept proposed a 10 storey mixed-use building. The Municipal Heritage Committee provided comments on the 2020 HIA and development plan, which MHBC responded to in March 2021.

The applicant has since revised the development proposal and reduced the building height from 10 storeys to 8 storeys, and slightly extended the building. MHBC has reviewed the revised concept plan. The revisions to the concept plan are minor, with the largest change to the building height. The 2020 HIA concluded that the previous development proposal at 10 storeys would have no impact on the adjacent heritage resources or the nearby Downtown Lindsay Heritage Conservation District.

The new concept plan is similar to what the 2020 HIA assessed, with the most significant change consisting of a reduced building height. Given that the revised concept plan proposes a similar building with a reduction to the height, the conclusions of the 2020 HIA remain the same. The development will not impact the Downtown Lindsay Heritage Conservation District or the listed properties across the road at 59-69 William Street N.

We understand that the Municipal Heritage Committee has provided new comments in a letter dated June 30, 2023 with respect to the revised development proposal. These comments are very similar to the 2021 MHC comments which MHBC addressed in a response letter. Nonetheless, MHBC has prepared a response to the most recent MHC comments. The response to comments is included in the attached.

Yours truly,

**MHBC**

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Dan Currie'.

Dan Currie, MA, MCIP, RPP, CAHP  
Partner

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'G. Smith'.

Gillian Smith, MSc, MCIP, RPP  
Planner

## MHBC Response to June 2023 MHC Comments

**MHC Comment #1: A Heritage Impact Assessment was completed when the application was originally filed but to a building design that was vastly different from what has been re-submitted. The Committee requests that a revised HIA be submitted to reflect the new design and requested amendments to provide a more accurate assessment of the proposed building's impact on the adjacent and nearby heritage resources.**

The 2020 HIA assessed the impact of a 10 storey building on the nearby Downtown Lindsay HCD. The HIA concluded that the 10 storey building would not impact the HCD. The development concept has been revised to reduce the building height from 10 to 8 storeys. MHBC has reviewed the revised design of the building. While the design has changed somewhat, it does not result in impacts to the HCD. The revised concept plan does not change the conclusions of the 2020 HIA.

MHBC understands that City of Kawartha Lakes has updated the definition of adjacent to now include properties which are across the road. This suggests that the listed properties at 59-69 William Street North should be assessed for impacts. The below chart concludes that these listed properties will not be impacted by the development.

**59-69 William Street North HIA**

<b>Impact</b>	<b>Level of Impact</b>	<b>Analysis</b>
<b>Destruction or alteration of heritage attributes</b>	No impact	The proposed development will not result in the destruction or alteration of any heritage properties or attributes of 59-69 William Street North.
<b>Shadows</b>	No impact	A shadow study was completed for the 10 storey concept plan. The shadow study identified that the proposed building would not result in shadows that extend to the listed heritage properties. The reduced building height would certainly not cast shadows on the heritage properties.
<b>Isolation</b>	No impact	The proposed development will not isolate the heritage properties. The properties will remain in their current location and retain their character.
<b>Direct or Indirect Obstruction of Views</b>	No impact	The proposed development does not obstruct significant views of the heritage properties. The viewing opportunity is of the front façade of the buildings, as seen from the public right of way along William Street North. This view will not be impacted.
<b>A Change in Land Use</b>	No impact	There will be no change in land use to these properties.
<b>Land Disturbance</b>	No impact	There are no expected land disturbances as a result of the new construction that will impact heritage resources. The properties are located a sufficient distance away. Nevertheless, that a vibration monitoring plan should be completed as a precaution.

**MHC Comment #2:** While the Committee is supportive of the reduction in height from the original application, it feels that eight storeys is still too large of a structure for this location. The height of the building has the potential to substantially change the existing streetscape which is comprised primarily of two to four storey buildings. This includes the adjacent two-storey listed terrace.

The subject lands are not part of a Heritage Conservation District, Cultural Heritage Landscape or other identified heritage area. There are no policies related to the management of character or context for the subject lands. The HIA concluded that the proposed development would not impact heritage resources. MHBC has reviewed the revised design and concludes that the design will equally have no impacts to heritage resources.

To achieve "Compatible development" is not to have "the same as", but rather to co-exist without impact. The HIA has identified that the proposed building will not adversely impact the HCD. With surrounding development planned to be the same height, and with no impacts identified on the adjacent heritage properties or HCD, the proposed 8 storey building is compatible.

**MHC Comment #3:** The streetscape of this portion of William Street North is evolving. The Downtown Lindsay Heritage Conservation District Plan identifies appropriate massing for a five-storey building within the district, as an example. A building adjacent to the district should follow similar height and massing.

The subject lands are not within or adjacent to the Heritage Conservation District. The Plan does not apply to the subject lands.

**MHC Comment #4:** There are a number of important views and vistas within this area of downtown Lindsay which will be impacted by the proposed development. These include the views to the downtown from various areas of the town, views from and along the Scugog River, and views of St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church and its bell tower which are local landmarks. It is likely that the proposed development will fully or partially obscure many of these character-defining views.

Neither the Official Plan or Heritage Conservation District Plan identify significant or important views to or from the subject lands. All identified views within the HCD Plan are to or from lands within the district, and do not apply to lands outside of the district.

The HIA assessed the impacts of views. The HIA notes that while the building will be visible in the background from certain areas of the Town, it will not obstruct significant views identified in the HCD. Viewing opportunities south towards St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church and the HCD will be maintained from the public right of way along William Street North. Current views to the Scugog River are already partially obstructed by the existing building and treeline along the rear of the property. The new building will not obscure any significant or protected character defining view sheds.

**MHC Comment #5:** The position of the building being at the end of William Street is directly visible from Kent Street and will interfere with the viewscape from the downtown by imposing its height, mass and contemporary style as a barrier.

As noted, significant view sheds are not identified beyond those found within the Heritage Conservation District. The subject lands are not identified as a significant view shed. While the building will be visible in the background of the Kent Street view northwards, it will not negatively impact or obstruct significant viewing opportunities. The view from Kent Street is also further away from the building, and therefore its height will be less visible given the viewing distance.



**MHC Comment #6:** The Committee would suggest that the massing of the building be modified to include a step back at the third storey which would mitigate the height of the building from a pedestrian perspective. This would necessitate a reduction in the density requested.

The building design has incorporated various forms of building articulation to ensure appropriate placement and reduce the appearance of massing. These articulation measures include contrasting colours, projections/recessions, platform roof, accent lines, different types of glazing and building materials. The purpose of such measures is to create a pedestrian scaled building and promote ground floor interest by drawing the attention down to the pedestrian level. The design measures included for the proposed development should be sufficient to achieve an appropriate human scaled development, however, at the site plan stage consideration will be given to additional design measures.

**MHC Comment #7:** The Committee is concerned about the impact of the vibration from underground construction on the foundations of historic buildings and would request that a vibration monitoring plan be prepared, as suggested in the Heritage Impact Assessment submitted with the initial submission

Agreed. No further response.

**MHC Comment #8:** The City's tourism and resident attraction strategies have aimed to attract visitors and new residents to local communities, including Lindsay, through their picturesque Victorian downtowns and unique architectural character. The proximity of this development to the downtown and its potential to alter the character of downtown Lindsay is in opposition to these strategies which identify the character of its commercial areas as an asset to preserved and celebrated.

The subject lands are not located within the Downtown Lindsay Heritage Conservation District or any other identified heritage area, and are therefore not subject to the HCD Plan policies. The Lindsay HCD has been recognized as a distinct area with a unique heritage character and has been established to protect the character and heritage attributes specific to this neighbourhood of Lindsay. The policies of the plan do not extend beyond the boundaries of the HCD. The character of the Downtown Lindsay HCD cannot be altered by development that occurs outside of it. While the development is of a larger scale than what exists within the Downtown Lindsay HCD, it will not impact the character of the HCD given that it is not within the HCD.

The HIA completed in November of 2020 assessed the impacts of the proposed development on the HCD and concluded that it would not adversely impact the HCD. The character of downtown Lindsay will be maintained and will not be impacted by the proposed development.

If there are concerns about the design of the building as it relates to conformity with the City's urban design objectives and policies, those concerns should be addressed through an urban design brief and site plan approval process.

**MHC Comment #9: The Committee is not opposed to the redevelopment of this site for mixed-use residential purposes. However, new construction on this site must be compatible with the surrounding historic landscape in its height, massing, materials and architectural design so that it can blend harmoniously with the existing community.**

Compatible and compatibility have been defined through the Ontario Land Tribunal. Compatible does not mean "the same as", but rather, means "the ability to coexist in harmony". Harmony is achieved through the absence of impact. If there are negative impacts resulting from a land use change, then that land use change cannot be considered to be compatible with the adjacent or surrounding area. The HIA identified that the previous 10 storey building would not adversely impact the adjacent listed property or the Downtown Lindsay HCD. MHBC has reviewed the revised design and concludes there is no impact to heritage resources.

The subject lands are nearby to, but outside of the Downtown Lindsay HCD. Therefore, the policies and guidelines of the HCD Plan do not apply. While the proposed building will be of a greater scale and height than what currently exists within the area, measures have been taken to reduce the appearance of massing. Such measures include the use of a flat roof, rather a gable or hip roof. Whereas a gable or hip roof would effectively increase the overall height of the building, a flat roof maintains that the maximum height of the building is truly 8 storeys. The design also uses different colours window sizes and glazing, where the ground floor is darker with larger floor to ceiling windows to draw the eyes down.

This HIA has demonstrated that the proposed development will not have negative impacts on the heritage value or attributes of the adjacent property or nearby HCD. No alteration or destruction to cultural heritage resources is proposed, and no impacts are expected. Therefore even though the building is of greater size and scale than the adjacent buildings it is compatible.

**MHC Comment #10: Although the Committee does not expect a new building to replicate a historic structure, the architectural design of new construction should take into consideration some of the design elements from the older construction in the surrounding area. This would include the use of elements such as red and/or buff brick, cornices, and gables. By doing so, the new construction would be more sympathetic to the surrounding historic area and be better integrated into Lindsay's unique historic downtown creating a softened impact at the end view of the Heritage Conservation District. The Committee is satisfied to address these architectural considerations through the Site Plan Approval process.**

The final design of the building will be determined through the site plan approval process. This is a process required by the Town.